

Globethics Repository

The logo for Globethics, featuring the word "Globethics" in white sans-serif font on a blue rectangular background.

The Orientation of the Taiwanese Catholic Church during Chiang Kai-shek's Government: Sinicization in the Pursuit of Identity

This page was generated automatically upon download from the Globethics Repository. More information on Globethics see <https://www.globethics.net>. Data and content policy of Globethics Repository see <https://repository.globethics.net/pages/policy>.

Item Type	Article
Authors	Chen, Congming
Publisher	Christian Study Centre on Chinese Religion and Culture, Chung Chi College
Rights	With permission of the license/copyright holder
Download date	2026-09-20 17:16:04
Link to Item	http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.12424/166181

The Orientation of the Taiwanese Catholic Church during Chiang Kai-shek's Government: Sinicization in the Pursuit of Identity

CHEN TSUNG-MING

Abstract

This research focuses on three aspects which characterized the Taiwanese society in the period of Chiang Kai-shek: regulations of laws, intelligence network, and cultural movements. These measures can be regarded as the means to achieve the official priorities of recovering the Mainland China. With this historical background in consideration, this research aims to observe the process and result of the orientation of the Taiwanese Catholic Church toward sinicization. Besides, it tries to demonstrate, through liturgies of the time, the impacts of the Nationalist government and the ideology of the prelates on the inculturation (indigenization) of the Taiwanese Church in the post-Vatican II era.

CHEN Tsung-ming (CHEN Congming 陳聰銘) is post-doctoral fellow at Academia Catholica, Fu Jen University, Taipei. This article was prepared for the international symposium organized on May 30, 2006 in Paris by the European Association of Taiwan Studies under the supervision of the School of Oriental and African Studies. After modifying and supplementing the paper with more documents and archival evidence, it is hoped that a more complete picture of the subject can be shown.

The objective of Christian mission is to implant a local Church by establishing a local community.¹ Since each group of people has its own cultural tradition and way of living which are different from other ethnic groups, the members of this native community have their own specific behaviors and ways to express their affection toward the object of worship. In summing up briefly the constant transformation of adaptations to the local customs when a religion is introduced to a group of people, some terms are often used by theologians and anthropologists, such as *inculturation*, *indigenization*, or *accommodation*.

The contemporary history of Taiwan under Chiang Kai-shek's (Jiang Jieshi 蔣介石) government was marked by re-sinicization² of the island, which consisted of a series of political measures that were applied in all fields. It followed that, on the one hand, the government claimed the legitimacy of its unique political authority over all China, which needed to be recognized by the people. On the other hand, it devoted itself to the pursuit of official recognition by the foreign countries. Due to the "Communist rebellion" in Mainland China, the "legal" way for carrying out this policy rested on the declaration of martial law in May 1949. This law, enacted in the name of the General Mobilization of the State in emergency, was strictly designed to control social order (often by means of eliminating political dissidents) and project the recovery of the Mainland.

By no means shirking the obligation to support the government, the Catholic clergy in Taiwan was obliged to integrate into the framework of sinicization, the priority of national policy. In order to analyze the process of sinicization, this study has investigated three areas: regulations of laws, intelligence network, and cultural movements. This research helps us to understand, through the political and ideological aspects of the religious authorities, the physiognomy of the Church's inculturation and her action in international politics under this social context and hierarchical leadership.

This study is divided into four sections. First of all, it begins with a presentation of the Nationalist government's political measures toward sinicization. Secondly, there will be a discussion on the Taiwanese

¹ Compare Hu Guozhen 胡國楨, SJ, "Jianli zhenshi de zaidi Jidutu tuanti: Liyi benweihua de jingshen suozaizai" 建立真實的在地基督徒團體——禮儀本位化的精神所在 [Establishing a Real Local Christian Community: The Essence of Liturgical Inculturation], *Shenxue lunji* 神學論集 [Theological Essays] 134 (Winter 2002): 582–89.

² In this study, *sinicization* means a series of cultural transformation into Chinese style. The first sinicization occurred before the Japanese colonization.

Episcopate from the perspective of “church-state” relationship. The international actions of the Episcopate in promoting the prestige of Chiang’s government could reflect the prelates’ political ideology. Thirdly, this study will find out how the impact of the imperatives imposed by the government and the compulsion motivated by the Episcopate converged to create a program to erect a local Church of China as a consequence of the sinicization process. A pamphlet of trial prayer, which is characterized by a strong Chinese identity and an antipathy toward communism, can testify to the ecclesial orientation during Chiang’s reign. Fourth and lastly, the study will conclude with a reflection upon the problems discussed in the previous sections.

1. THE SINICIZATION OF TAIWAN UNDER THE IMPACT OF MULTIPLE POLITICAL AND JURIDICAL CONTROLS AS WELL AS VARIOUS CULTURAL MOVEMENTS

The notion of “ideological war” in which the government dedicates itself to straightening out the national spirit is not new for the Chinese Nationalist leaders. Due to the weakness of China in the face of the Japanese troops, they tried to strengthen the people’s moral fiber and highlighted the importance of discipline. Another intention was to save the government’s authority by launching the New Life Movement, which was rigorously promoted since 1934.³ When the Nationalist regime arrived at Taiwan, the Movement exerted remarkable cultural influence and replaced other movements by synthesizing their main ideas.

With the purpose of perpetuating a correct individual and collective behavior, the Movement referred back to Chinese literary classics. It was concerned not only with maintaining morality in the family, but also cultivating loyalty toward the home country and the government. After being transplanted to Formosa, the Movement extended its implications to anti-communism, which was justified, first of all, as a war

³ Zheng Jiemin 鄭傑民, *Bendang tuixing gexiang shehui yundong chengguo zhi yanjiu* 本黨推行各項社會運動成果之研究 [A Study on the Result of All Social Movements Implemented by Our Party] (Taipei: Central Commission of the *Guomindang*, October 1956), volume: General Archives, no. 558/303, stenciling paper, Historical Commission of the *Guomindang*, Taipei, pp. 3–8.

for justice. Secondly, the re-promotion of the Movement signified the continual legitimacy of the political authority of the Nationalist Party (*Guomindang* 國民黨). The campaign promoting Chinese traditional values aimed at assimilating the Taiwanese people wholly into the Chinese culture to the extent that they would identify themselves as “Chinese.” Then their Chinese identity would enable the government to pursue its supreme policy—to recover the Mainland and save their suffering compatriots from the Communist dictatorship. This campaign, depending largely on national education, contained two fundamental aspects: culture and supervision.

An important means of sinicization was the propagation of Mandarin Chinese as the official language which was imposed by the authorities as one of the priorities of national policy. Previously, the Japanese colonial authorities had imposed the learning of Japanese language upon the Formosans. With the outbreak of the Sino-Japanese War since 1937 and the new war line against the USA in the Pacific from 1941, the Japanese government reinforced Japanization or *Huang min hua yundong* 皇民化運動 (a movement that made people become the subjects of the emperor) among Taiwanese people in order to integrate Taiwan with the empire as soon as possible. The colonial government accelerated the circulation of Japanese as the only official language in society, especially in the education system. Only the Japanese version of the bible was officially authorized in the ecclesial circles. Besides, dialects such as Minnan 閩南, Hakka 客家, and aboriginal languages could also be used in writing, either in Chinese characters or Romanized phonetic symbols. Nevertheless, some difficulties may arise in translating dialects into Chinese or vice versa, since many words and expressions do not have equivalents or suitable translations in the other dialect. In the colonial era, many local people, particularly those who lived in the villages and countryside, were illiterate. Japanese and the dialects were their common oral languages; only the elite and those who attended private schools could write and read Chinese. If the Protestant missionaries wanted to evangelize the local people who did not speak Chinese well, they often explained the bible in dialects (particularly in Minnan), with the help of the Roman script.⁴ It was just like the traditional way of “shuo shu” (說書, story-telling).

⁴ Ministry of Education, “Guanyu Luoma zimu pinyin wenzi anjian chuli jingguo cankao ziliao” 關於羅馬字母拼音文字案件處理經過參考資料 [Reference Materials on the Cases of Dealing with Phonetic Transcriptions in Roman Script], December 1969, volume: Luomazi Shengjing ji shukan chuli banfa 羅馬字聖經及書刊處理辦法

Soon after the Nationalist government began to exercise political authority in Taiwan in 1945, it adopted a Mandarin policy to exclude the Japanese language from the island as quickly as possible. Laws promoting the use of Mandarin came into effect after the restoration of the Taiwan government, thus making the circulation of dialects in Roman script unlawful. The adoption of this policy stirred up different reactions among the Catholic Church and the Protestant Churches. It provoked strong oppositions from the Presbyterian Church, since many believers did not speak Mandarin and some were even illiterate. After the Roman script was prohibited, the official system of phonetic symbols could not solve the problem, since this system by no means conveyed the correct pronunciation for either Minnan or Hakka. Nevertheless, under the supreme national policy of promoting Chinese culture, nothing was more important than sinicization.

However, with the exception of some missionaries working in certain places around the island,⁵ this policy did not hinder the activities of Catholic missionaries, for most of the Chinese and foreign clergymen came from the Mainland. Without difficulty, they were able to communicate with one portion of the population immediately due to their familiarity with the language, which allowed them to start the missions at once. In 1954, archbishop Mgr. Guo Ruoshi 郭若石, bishop of the diocese of Taipei, issued twelve precautions to new missionaries in his diocese, two of which concerned the issue of Mandarin.⁶ These precautions ensured that all the missionaries respected the official regulations.

Feeling lonely in Taiwan, many refugees converted to Catholicism so as to make friends in Christian groups. They felt more comfortable with the Christian message, since the missionaries shared the same fate as theirs. Some missionaries also spoke the dialect or native accent of their home region in Mainland China. It was surely a big surprise and joy for the refugees to hear the same accent as their own from a missionary's mouth. In their eyes, it was much easier to make contact with

[Ways in Dealing with the Bible and Magazines in Roman Script], no. 172-3 / 5679, Academia Historica in Taiwan.

⁵ For example, the priests and sisters of the Maryknoll (most of them are Americans) in Taizhong 臺中, the largest city in the centre of the island, learned Minnan rather than Mandarin. The bishop Mgr. Kupfer was a good example; he learned Minnan.

⁶ Joseph Ruoshi Guo, Mgr., *The Indications of the Precautions Addressed to All Clergy of the Diocese of Taipei*, March 7, 1954, stenciling paper, personal sources of Chen Tsung-ming.

the Mainlanders than with the Formosans.⁷ In 1949, there were 10,591 Catholic conversions;⁸ in 1970, there were 303,820.⁹ Such rapid growth was partly related to their linguistic advantage.

One means of sinicization is to modify a person's way of living and thinking. The launch of the Cultural Revolution in Mainland China in 1966 offered an opportunity for the leaders in Taipei to spread the propaganda that Taiwan was recognized as the last land where real Chinese culture was perfectly preserved. The Movement for the Renaissance of the Chinese Culture that began in the following year emphasized, on the one hand, the official language policy which was already started, and, on the other hand, the attack against Beijing regime by using literary forms. The importance of this Movement is shown by the fact that Chiang Kai-shek kept the chairmanship for himself, while entrusting the membership of the standing committee¹⁰ to Mgr. Yu Pin (Yu Bin 于斌),¹¹ then the archbishop and leader of the Catholic Church. The trust and charge shown by President Chiang to Mgr. Yu were never haphazard. Their friendship was consolidated following Mgr. Yu's overseas propaganda in favor of the Nationalist government during the Sino-Japanese war.¹² As the members of the Catholic Church were persecuted by the Communists throughout China, it was not surprising that the clergy did not show enthusiasm toward atheist Communism, but firmly supported the Nationalist government. Since then, the Catholic Church was considered to be a strong ally of the *Guomindang*.

⁷ Octave Brière's letter to Pierre Pélissier, SJ, Taichung, April 21, 1954, Jesuits' Archives Centre in Vanves, Paris.

⁸ Jiang Chuande 江傳德, *Tianzhujiao zai Taiwan* 天主教在台灣 [Catholicism in Taiwan] (Kaohsiung: Shandao zhokanshe, 1992), 327.

⁹ Taiwan diqu zhujiaotuan mishuchu 台灣地區主教團秘書處 [The Secretariat of the Chinese Regional Bishops' Conference, SCRBC], ed., *Taiwan Tianzhujiao shouce* 台灣天主教手冊 [Taiwan Catholic Church Directory] (Taipei: SCRBC, 1972), 575.

¹⁰ He was one of the first eighteen members chosen by the President (from 1967 to 1969). Lin Guoxian 林果顯, "Zhonghua wenhua fuxing yundong tuixing weiyuanhui" *zhi yanjiu*, 1966–1975: *Tongzhi zhengdangxing de jianli yu zhuanbian* 「中華文化復興運動推行委員會」之研究 1966–1975——統治正當性的建立與轉變 [A Study of the "Committee for Promoting the Movement for the Renaissance of the Chinese Culture," 1966–1975: The Establishment and Transformation of the Legitimacy of Government] (Taipei: Daoxiang, 2005), 102, 124.

¹¹ Yu Pin (1901–1978), consecrated bishop of Nanking in 1936, was promoted to the rank of archbishop of this Nationalist capital in 1945. He was elevated to cardinal in 1969.

¹² Raymond J. De Jaegher, *Life of Archbishop Paul YU Pin* (Vietnam: Free Pacific, 1959), 22–23.

Another governmental means for maintaining control over society depended on omnipresent supervision. The archives proved that some agents sent by the *Guomindang* or by the intelligence services worked openly or secretly within the administrative body of the Church to form a bridge for tripartite communication among the religious, political, and Party authorities.¹³

Under these circumstances, how did the Church undertake the task of inculturation? What were the characteristics of this inculturation while the political and social factors of the anti-Communist era came into play for the Church's transformation during the Cold War? These issues will be considered below.

2. INTERNAL IMPERATIVES OF THE TAIWANESE EPISCOPATE IN PURSUIT OF SINICIZATION FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF "CHURCH-STATE" RELATIONSHIP

When the Korean War broke out in June 1950, religious persecution took place daily throughout the Chinese Mainland due to a strong xenophobic wave under the impetus of the political leaders. In September 1951, the police used force in order to expel the internuncio, Mgr. Riberi. The Holy See's efforts that were devoted to establishing official relations with the Communist regime¹⁴ came to a dead end. The missionaries were mostly expelled from the country by 1955.¹⁵ Rome and all the clergy of the China mission in exile could only hope

¹³ "Diaocha yuanjing xinjiao renshu" 調查員警信教人數 [Investigation on the Number of Believers Amongst the Police Agents], secret, July 30, 1955, volume: Taizhongxian jingchaju 台中縣警察局 [Police Station of Taichung District], Tome: 487/007, Academia Historica in Taiwan; "Shengai qianqiu: Fenxiang dagong huiyi zhi jingfei buzhu huo daikuan wenti" 聖愛千秋——分享大公會議之經費補助或貸款問題 [Discussion on the Problem of Subsidies or Loan for Shooting the Movie by the Catholic Church, *Saint Eternal Love*], May 11, 1962, volume: International Religious Activities (2), 172–4 / 0238–2, Academia Historica in Taiwan.

¹⁴ See the archives of volume: Asie-Océanie, 1944–1955, Chine, no. 187, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of France; volume: Eu-Europe, Saint-Siège, 1949–1955, no. 26, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of France.

¹⁵ The last missionary bishop, James Edward Walsh, was liberated in July 1970. See Osservatore Romano, "Interview de Mgr Walsh," *Documentation catholique*, no. 1569, Paris, 6 septembre 1970, pp. 782–86; Paul VI, "La libération de Mgr Walsh," *Documentation catholique*, no. 1568, Paris, 2–16 août 1970, p. 744.

for a return to their mission in the coming years. Mgr. Riberi ordered these exiled bishops to keep their Episcopal title that were consecrated previously by Rome, although they could not exercise any jurisdiction outside their territory in China.¹⁶ As the Cardinal Tian Gengxin 田耕莘 was the archbishop of Beijing 北京, Mgr. Yu Pin remained the archbishop of Nanking 南京, and Mgr. André-Jean Vérineux, m.e.p., bishop of Hualian 花蓮 in Taiwan and simultaneously of Yingkou 營口 in the Mainland.

In keeping with the Vatican's order, the Nationalist authorities did not permit the bishops to abandon their ecclesial title in China either, since this would be regarded as advocating a scission of the national territory. According to the martial law, the action of abandoning the title would be classified as an intention of rebellion and the accused person would be condemned to the death penalty, or life imprisonment, or confinement for ten years.

So far as the importance of the Episcopal title to the China mission was concerned, its significance lay in the *de jure* claim of the Taiwanese Episcopate of its legitimate representation of all ecclesial circumscriptions in the territory of China. It reminds us of the Nationalist government's international claim to impose the "One China" policy on all the countries in the world. It seems that the exiled bishops insisted on their legitimate authority in China in order to refute the fact that they were bishops without ecclesial jurisdiction there. Moreover, they were staying in Taiwan.

As we have mentioned above, due to the friendship of President Chiang and Mgr. Yu in wartime, Mgr. Yu enjoyed some prestige in political circles: he was elected as one of the vice-presidents of the National Assembly.¹⁷ Maintaining a wide personal acquaintance amongst various important politicians worldwide, he ran for the diplomacy of the Republic of China. His contributions were fruitful in re-establishing the relation with Spain in 1952, promoting official relations with the Philippines, Vietnam, South Korea, and many countries in Latin America.¹⁸

¹⁶ Fernando Mateos, SJ, *China Jesuits in East-Asia, Starting from Zero, 1949–1957* (unpublished work, Taipei: Chinese Province of Society of Jesus, 1995), 273.

¹⁷ He had been elected as delegate in Mainland China. He was a member of the National Assembly in Taiwan as well.

¹⁸ Chen Fangzhong 陳方中, *Yu Bin shuji zhuan* 于斌樞機傳 [The Biography of Cardinal Yu Pin] (Taipei: Taiwan Shangwu, 2001), 181–201.

However, his political activities procured Mgr. Riberi's reprobation.¹⁹ Being well known for his international lobbying for the sake of the Nationalist government, he was seen by the western diplomats as a "disguised agent of *Guomindang*."²⁰

The efforts to justify the legitimacy of the Taipei regime were the result of the religious persecution suffered by all the clergy who were exiled from China. On various occasions, the Taiwanese Episcopate addressed all the Catholics in the world appealing for the support of their governments for Chiang's regime.

This support permits it to launch a holy war supported by God against the Communist regime so as to save the compatriots behind the Iron Curtain and for the benefit of all humanity and the truth.²¹

A similar appeal was made in favor of strengthening the links between Free China and the Holy See:

In order to win the sympathy of the twelve-million overseas Chinese with respect to the Catholic Church, the Holy See should strengthen its relations with Free China, since they support President Chiang Kai-shek's government.²²

The international action of the Taiwanese Episcopate focused on two objectives: to place in a prominent position the persecution occurring in Communist China and to proclaim its episcopal jurisdiction upon the whole Chinese Church. The fact that these bishops in exile could not *de facto* take charge of the mission in the Mainland made their claims about the legitimacy of their competence feeble. The Propagation of the Faith in the Vatican informed them officially that

¹⁹ Cattand, *Télégramme à l'arrivée*, Taipei, 25 mars 1954, no. 184, volume: *Asie 1944–1967*, Formose, 1956–1967, no. 23, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of France.

²⁰ Report of the minister plenipotentiary, delegate of the provisional government of France in USA, no. 178, "Politique du Vatican en Extrême-Orient," Washington, DC, November 22, 1944, volume: *Asie-Océanie 1944–1955*, Chine, Tome: 187, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of France.

²¹ Paul Pin Yu, "An Appeal of the Chinese Catholic Church," *Zhongguo Tianzhujiao wenhua xiehui* 中國天主教文化協會 [Chinese Catholic Cultural Association], May 24, 1951, p. 2, volume: *Taiwanese Catholic Cultural Association and Other Associations Make Worldwide Appeal to Fight against Communism*, no. 172–3 / 5581, *Academia Historica* in Taiwan.

²² Anonym, scribbling paper to the Cardinal Celso Costantini, [February?] 1953, manuscript in Chinese, personal sources of Chen Tsung-ming, p. 4.

they were henceforth under the authority of their local bishop. This information gave the impression that they had lost the episcopal competence.²³ Since their title could never be relieved, they found themselves in an embarrassing and agonizing dilemma.

Although Yu Pin's political activities provoked polemics about the principle of neutrality toward politics within and outside the Taiwanese Church, his prestige served sometimes as a talisman for the activities of missionaries. By the end of the 1960s the issue of liberation theology in the universal Church was widely discussed, especially in Latin America. In 1970, a missionary priest inspired by this theology promoted social justice several times in extracurricular activities at Fu Jen Catholic University 天主教輔仁大學. One day, the police arrested him in the presence of his students. Being the president of the university, Cardinal Yu Pin immediately intervened in this affair by contacting some high-ranking officials in the relevant ministries. This priest was released shortly after.²⁴ As a matter of fact, during his lifetime, no religious persecution occurred in the Catholic Church, possibly because of Cardinal Yu Pin's prestige.

Moreover, some priests maintained good relations with Madame Chiang Kai-shek, especially the American Jesuits. Many epistolary communications between Father Albert O'Hara, SJ, (1907–1983) and the First Lady proved their friendship.²⁵ As for the acquaintance of some Jesuits, Father O'Hara helped her several times by correcting rough drafts of English speeches.²⁶

The Catholic priests' good personal relationship with the government could be used in the cause of unexpected incidents, which put the Catholic Church in a privileged position compared to the Presbyterian Church. Normally speaking, the religious policy of the Nationalist government relied on two aspects. The Catholic Church endeavored to raise the quality of life, for instance, in the fields of education and medical care. In this case, the authorities favored these activities of charity to be carried on. For the sake of "national security," the au-

²³ Vox Cleri, "Zhongguo zhujiaotuan dierci zai Luoma jihui jilu" 中國主教團第二次在羅馬集會記錄 [Note on the Second Meeting of the Chinese Bishop's Union in Rome], *Duo-sheng* 鐸聲 [Vox Cleri] 2 (November 15, 1962): 39–40.

²⁴ Interview with priest A, May 23, 2002 and February 13, 2003, Taipei.

²⁵ All the epistolary correspondence is conserved in the Memorial Library of Father Albert O'Hara, Tien Educational Centre, Taipei.

²⁶ Interview with Father André Lefebvre, SJ, on November 28, 2007 and with Father Fernando Mateos, SJ, (archivist Jesuit) on January 15, 2008, Tien Educational Centre, Taipei.

thorities kept all activities under strict supervision and control by means of laws. For the political leaders, the Church's services were regarded as "utility" and the Church was a "private, civil association" which should respect national regulations.

In the arena of international politics, the Catholic Church was a witness that had been suffering from the Communist persecutions. The government could use the symbolic representation of the Taiwanese Episcopate in China to justify her political propaganda in the world. This role became even more important after the expulsion of the Republic of China from the United Nations in 1971.

3. THE CONCRETIZATION OF THE PROGRAM FOR ESTABLISHING A LOCAL CHINESE CHURCH

According to the teachings of the Second Vatican Council (1962–1965), being given that the diocese (a particular church, composed of parishes) constitutes an essential component of a local Church, the implantation of a local Church depends on the diocese of which the administrator is the bishop. The bishop's role and authority are thus reinforced. The Bishops' Conference that assembles all bishops of a country or a demarcated territory decides the overall orientation of this Church and executes their pastoral charge. Hence, this organization is effectively the locomotive for the inculturation of the local Church. The Documents of the Council delegate to the Conference some specific competences with which the bishops can determine ecclesial affairs (for instance, some liturgical worship) without prior consultation with Rome.

Being convinced that Taiwan is an integral part of China, the prelates devoted as much effort as possible to inculturation in the Chinese culture. At the beginning of Vatican II, Mgr. Yu wrote a blueprint for setting up a local Church in China—after recovering the Mainland, the responsibility of re-erecting the Church would be devolved upon the members of the Taiwanese Church. The first task should be harmonizing Catholicism with the Chinese culture, particularly in the area of Catholic liturgy.²⁷ The other ecclesiastical work, such as mass media,

²⁷ Yu Pin, Mgr., "Cong Dagong huiyi kan Dalu jiaohui chongjian de yuanjing" 從大公會議看大陸教會重建的遠景 [Re-erecting the Church in Mainland China from the Per-

education, evangelization of the laity, and social services, should favor the sacerdotal vocations in Taiwan in order to meet the future demand for priesthood in Mainland China.²⁸

As a matter of fact, the issue of harmonization between Catholicism and Chinese culture has been the focus of debates and studies from the beginning of Matteo Ricci's mission in China, especially since the 1960s. Mgr. Yu emphasized it in the specific context of the time, hoping to form a "tri-union"—including Catholicism, Chinese culture, and anti-communism.

The Federation of Asian Bishops' Conferences, which took place in Taipei in April 1974, reaffirmed the conclusion of the Council in pursuit of permanent dialogue

with the living traditions, the cultures, the religions—in brief, with all the life-realities of the people in whose midst it has sunk its roots deeply and whose history and life it gladly makes its own.²⁹

By the end of 1975, the Taiwanese Episcopate elaborated the program for the "Establishment of the Local Church of China" and propounded it in January 1976 to concretize the previous project of Mgr. Yu Pin. Although this program was announced in January 1976, which is beyond the time scale of our study, it is worthy of mention here, since it took several years for Mgr. Yu and the other prelates to conceive and elaborate this program. We can find the principle and orientation of this program in his writings and speeches delivered in the preceding two decades. From our point of view, this program is a milestone in the development of the Church since the installation of the ecclesial hierarchy in 1950.

Unremittingly maintaining its stand of episcopate jurisdiction throughout China, the Taiwanese Episcopate justified *a fortiori* its pace of sinicization. The program, being designed to remind the lay people

spective of the Second Vatican Council], *Heng-yi* 恆毅 12, no. 11 (June 1963): 3–4. The speech was given in May 1963.

²⁸ Yu Pin, "Study of the Project Intended to Re-establish the Future Continental Chinese Church," *Zhongguo Tianzhujiào wénxié chuānglǐ sìshí nián* 中國天主教文協創立四十年 [The 40th Anniversary of the Catholic Culture Society of China] (Taipei: Catholic Culture Society of China, 1980), 40–42. The speech was given in June 1962.

²⁹ "Statements and Recommendations of the First Plenary Assembly of Federation of Asian Bishops' Conferences," *L'Osservatore Romano* (June 20, 1974): 9.

and clergy of the responsibility to recover the Mainland,³⁰ required large-scale reforms to achieve sinicization. The formation of a local clergy was a priority, but *a priori* imbued with traditional Chinese culture. This program reiterated the intransigence of the Catholic conviction toward communism and the support for the national anti-Communist policy. The Catholic anti-Communist actions went hand in hand with the spreading of Christian doctrine.³¹

In fact, nobody can deny the reality that Taiwan belonged to China from 1945 and that the *Guomindang* authorities, being the only political authority, governed *de facto* the territory of the island. This authority was represented as the only legitimate government in China, a legitimacy justified by its place in the Security Council in the United Nations until 1971. The sinicization policy was hardly contested, since the origin of the population was almost exclusively Chinese, except for the aboriginal minorities. Yet the sinicization undertaken by the Episcopate tended to neglect delicate nuances among local cultures—Minnan, Hakka, and especially the aboriginal culture.

Was it not a contradiction with the Taiwanese Episcopate's declaration that all the resolutions of Asian Bishops' Conference should be implemented in Taiwan? With regard to the principles highlighted by the statement of the Federation of Asian Bishops' Conferences mentioned above, it was a question of its "manipulation of strategy" in interpreting this statement in order to carry out its new action in Taiwan's socio-cultural context. The legitimacy of authority and jurisdiction covering the whole Chinese Mainland maintained by both the government and the Episcopate justified the basis for the chain of reasoning around the strategy.

Addressing the anti-Communist war that was fought in the ideological sphere, Mgr. Yu Pin reaffirmed that the solution relied on both Catholicism and Confucianism since Communist doctrine was contrary to human rights. For the prelates, the Movement for the Renaissance of the Chinese Culture furnished a forum for debates with the aim of merging Catholicism and Confucianism. Mgr. Yu and several theologians advocated that the eventual harmonization of these two doctrines

³⁰ Secretariat of the Chinese Regional Bishops' Conference, *Jianshe Zhongguo difang jiaohui caoan* 建設中國地方教會草案 [A Draft Plan on Establishing a Local Church in China] (Taipei: Chinese Regional Bishops' Conference, 1976), 14.

³¹ Ibid.

could make up for the insufficiency of each other.³² This theory of fusion had become important sources of reference for future Chinese theological construction, a task carried on by the Episcopate and some priests.

As regard liturgical adaptation, one must first translate the references from Latin into the local language in order to study the liturgy. To implement this, the priests might borrow temporarily some current texts in civil society. Some texts could be added in case of need or necessity, since the bishops had the right to adjust the local liturgy according to the Second Vatican Council, provided that the fundamental form of the sacraments remained unchanged.³³

In 1971, an important event occurred that marked the Taiwanese Church's task of inculturation—the very first “Worship to Heaven and Honor to Ancestors” in Chinese style took place in the assembly hall of a high school in Taipei on the occasion of Chinese New Year. The ceremony and worship were performed as a trial measure, following which modifications would be made.

Encouraged by the great success and positive responses to the first trial ceremony, the Episcopate continued with this in the following years and modified some paragraphs only in order to describe Taiwan's recent international situation. For the feast of Chinese New Year in 1974, a pamphlet for trial worship under the direction of the archbishop of Taipei was issued in one of the biggest parishes (Holy Family Church, a Jesuit parish) in Taipei, which testified to the impacts of political events associated with national destiny and the prelates' political ideology, impacts as “signs of times.”

The ceremony included four parts: homily, honor to the ancestors, worship to God, and mutual greetings of participants.³⁴ The whole text links up scriptural lines and lectures of panegyric (added by the authors of this text) addressed to God and deceased people. The lines, which attract attention, constitute the second and third parts and also the principal body of this rite.

³² Xiao Zhongquan 蕭仲泉 (recorder), *Yubin zuijin yanshuoji* 于斌最近演說集 [Collection of the Recent Speeches of Yu Pin] (Taipei: Zhongyang wenwu, 1954), 26–28.

³³ Art. 22:1 and 3, *La Sainte Liturgie*, *Sacrosanctum Concilium*.

³⁴ The Parish of Holy Family Church in Taipei, *Chunjie jitian jingzu dianli* 春節祭天敬祖典禮 [The Ritual Ceremony of Worship to Heaven and Honor to Ancestors in the Chinese New Year], worship permitted by Mgr. Luo Guang 羅光, archbishop of Taipei, 1974, document furnished by Mgr. Zhao Yizhou 趙一舟.

From this text, two principal characteristics can be found. First, the ethnic origin of the Taiwanese people is alleged in the first phrases:

The lineage of the Chinese people lasts permanently. The culture and traditions succeed from one era to the next one because of [the] Sages' merits.³⁵

The origins of the Chinese people are far back in the past.³⁶

The objective of the rite is pronounced:

The generations of Chinese people succeed constantly one [after] another; the cultural traditions are handed over by the Saints. The worship to God and honors to ancestors are inherited from one generation to another. . . .³⁷

Considered to be descendants of Chinese virtuous men and cultural inheritors of China, the Taiwanese people are obliged to conserve and develop the traditional heritage. In conformity with the essence of the Movement for the Renaissance of the Chinese Culture, the panegyric in classic style highlights Taiwan's privileged position for preserving the Chinese tradition, in contrast to China where this tradition was in the process of destruction. By re-instituting the traditional Chinese rites, the Episcopate intended to justify the consanguineous and cultural heritage for the sake of its statute *de jure* representing the whole Chinese Church, including the Mainland and Taiwan.

Secondly, the tone of the text is resolutely anti-Communist, with strong aversion toward the Chinese Communists. These lines of virulent condemnation of the Chinese Communists constitute one principal characteristic of the rite:

Our ancestors laboriously cultivated former waste lands. Their merits and diligence should be remembered forever. *Never forget their teachings in spite of the difficult period in which we are. [. . .] We must live by our own exertions and by our own efforts recover our country. The wicked persons should be killed and our morals strengthened.*

³⁵ Ibid, 5.

³⁶ Ibid, 9.

³⁷ Ibid, 5.

It is a deep sorrow that our country, China, is lost today. The Communist dictatorship is [crueler] than the first emperor of the Qin Dynasty. All the tombs, in which our ancestors are buried, are devastated and disappearing. Nowadays, short-sightedly, everyone tolerates compromises toward this Evil. May this misfortune end and luck comes. God bless the destiny of our country turning forever. God bless our head of state to enjoy longevity. May the situation improve and our armies recover the country. . . .

At this actual moment, our country is in disorder, since the Red catastrophe is spreading. How sad it is that our home country, China, is full of evil, as it has never been before: innumerable people are dying due to constant warfare. . . . God bless our people and our righteous army to return in victory after killing all the wicked bandits.³⁸

In order to overthrow the Communist regime, the Taiwanese Church consistently supported the Nationalist authorities hoping that their troops could launch a counter-attack to eliminate the Communists. Being an enthusiastic supporter of the Movement for the Renaissance of the Chinese Culture, Mgr. Yu Pin formulated the rites in the vernacular (with the collaboration of the local branches of the Movement and the local authorities) throughout the island, in churches as well as in civil circles.³⁹

Although this pamphlet was circulated in many parishes throughout Taiwan, the trial text was used for a few years only.⁴⁰ Besides, the text might have been varied and modified according to the priest's judgment in different parishes.⁴¹ Lately, the content was rectified on a large scale by Mgr. Guo Ruoshi, the archbishop in charge of liturgy. The paragraphs which showed strong hatred toward the Communists were finally deleted by the prelate due to their highly politicized connotations.⁴² Notwithstanding its ephemeral existence, this trial action of

³⁸ The Parish of Holy Family Church in Taipei, *Chunjie jitian jingzhu dianli*, 1974, personal sources of Chen Tsung-ming. Italics added.

³⁹ Fides, "Formose: ceremonies en l'honneur des ancêtres", 9 avril 1975, volume: (205) 125.5, Oeuvres pontificales missionnaires, Lyon, France.

⁴⁰ The "Worship to God and Honor to Ancestors" in Chinese style continues until nowadays, but the text changes in style and wordings from one year to another.

⁴¹ Interview with Fr. Higinio Arenas, SJ, January 21, 2003 in Peipu 北埔, Xinzhu 新竹 County.

⁴² Interview with Mgr. Zhao Yizhou, May 18, 2002 in the Secretariat of Chinese Regional Bishops' Conference, Taipei.

inculturation reflects some characteristics of the Chiang Kai-shek period.

4. THE INCULTURATION LEADING TO SINICIZATION: A VIRTUAL AND SOPHISTICATED IMAGE

As regards the contour and confines of the relationship between church and politics, Rome's teachings is that a particular Church, as a "humanitarian advisor," should participate positively in favor of the common interests in the mechanism of political decision-making and give constructive criticism to the leadership with respect to governmental measures without taking part directly or indirectly in political activities.⁴³ Namely, the objective of all its activities is related to evangelization.

Yet Mgr. Yu Pin's action made the confines of "church-state" ambiguous. Does it mean that, in face of the priority of an intangible principle—anti-Communism, the relation between church and state should be re-defined as the Church's unconditional support for the legitimate government? Did this make Taiwanese people confused? While the *Guomindang* authorities multiplied their strict control over the people by insisting on despotism⁴⁴ and eliminating political dissidents, the Episcopate not only kept silent during the "White Terror,"⁴⁵ but also supported it by taking concrete actions in Taiwan as well as in international meetings. Obviously, the attitude of the Episcopate relied on its choice to support the Nationalist government or not. For the prelates, when this government launched a campaign in all fields to resist the Communist regime, their solidarity with the official action may be seen as a voice and force that comforted the suffering soul of millions of

⁴³ Chang Chunshen, SJ, "The Church and National Policy," *East Asian Pastoral Review* 27, no. 2 (1980): 142.

⁴⁴ The limitation to Chiang Kai-shek's presidential mandate was removed by the National Assembly (*Guomin dahui* 國民大會) on March 1960 so that his mandate could be renewed again and again during his lifetime.

⁴⁵ Borrowed from the context of the French Revolution, the term "Terreur Blanche" signifies the government's violence aiming to oppress her political dissidents. In the history of Taiwan, "White Terror" generally refers to the period between 1949 and the lifting of martial law on July 15, 1987 by the son of the Generalissimo, Chiang Jingguo (Jiang Jingguo 蔣經國; 1978–1988).

people behind the Iron Curtain. Under this political context, it seems that this was the most difficult and delicate choice to make between the alternative.

Building on the wishes to return to the Mainland by counter-attack (which was impracticable), the program of erecting a local Church in China was in fact based on a vacuum and a mirage, as the issue of the consecrated Episcopal title in China's mission proved. This Episcopate was too much linked up with a system that was uncertain of the future to take enough roots with the people of this land.⁴⁶ The unrealistic program plus the prelates' political ideology resulted in an inculturation basing on an unrealistic image. Thus this inculturation could hardly create profound resonance amongst the majority of the inhabitants who are of Formosan ethnic origin.

In spite of the fact that the majority of the inhabitants are exclusively Chinese, the mainstream culture in Taiwan is Minnan and Hakka, which were regarded as sub-cultures or local cultures in Mainland China. For Mainlander priests and prelates, "all the population belongs to the Chinese race and shares the Chinese culture. Taiwanese is just one dialect, and Taiwan is just one part of China."⁴⁷ As a matter of fact, many Taiwanese priests and lay people felt the problem arising from the delicate differences between the Chinese culture and the other local cultures, but they avoided confrontation with the higher dignitaries in the ecclesiastic hierarchy, because they dared not challenge the authority of their "teachers."⁴⁸ It is concluded that one of the main problems in the implantation of the Taiwanese Church was the lack of native priests who, under the direction of the Church, would take the responsibility to elaborate future development with consideration of the local circumstances.

Therefore, the problem of the shortage of native priesthood had its roots in the beginning of the Catholic mission on the island. According to official data by 1982, the total baptized membership was about 290,000 including 126,000 (43.4%) Mainlanders, 84,000 (29%) Taiwanese (Minnan and Hakka), and 80,000 aborigines (27.6%, equal to

⁴⁶ J. Colgen, SJ, "Taiwan . . . Situation politique et religieuse," *Chine-Madagascar*, no. 151, Lille, SJ, (February/March 1975): 6.

⁴⁷ See the opinions of a group of interviewees—including prelates, priests, sisters, and lay persons in Taiwan—collected in a series of interviews conducted in the spring of 1984. Cheung Kahing, *Let Your Heart Be Bold, Taiwan: A Reflection Paper on Church-Workers and National Security* (Hong Kong: Centre for the Progress of Peoples, 1989) 24, 25.

⁴⁸ Cheung, *Let Your Heart Be Bold*, 31.

40% of the total aborigine population).⁴⁹ It is estimated that only about 29% of the whole Church are Taiwanese, whereas at least 83% of the population is Taiwanese. As mentioned before, the missionaries took advantage of their linguistic ability to approach the Chinese-speaking group with which they could freely communicate. To put it another way, they could not improve their connection with the majority of the population who speak the other languages, as long as they did not make themselves familiar with these languages. Such linguistic incompetence was much more serious among Mainlander clericals, since they did not show much interest in learning dialects.⁵⁰ Nevertheless, “the native language is the language from the heart.”⁵¹ The dialects represent a composition of life experiences shared by the peoples throughout many centuries. They include the customs and traditions which express their feelings toward the divinities. Thus they can be a bridge between the experiences of Western worship and Taiwanese worship. In the case of the missions in Taiwan, the linguistic obstacle has hindered the communication between the clericals and the Formosans, and between Catholicism and traditional Formosan culture.

From the aspects of cultural and ethnic composition of the Church, the Church was indeed orientated to sinicization. We may comment that the right direction for inculturation should be “Taiwanization.” However, the concept of “Taiwanization” has not yet become clear enough. The Catholic Church of Taiwan is still groping her way toward this objective, while the Republic of China in Taiwan searches for her political identity on the international scene. The definition of “Taiwanization” may vary from one period of time to another, following the changes in all dimensions of Taiwan society.

⁴⁹ See the statistics of the Secretariat of Chinese Regional Bishops' Conference. Cheung, *Let Your Heart Be Bold*, 20, 21. We cannot find the data of 1975. Nevertheless, the result would be more or less the same between the two periods, since the total baptized membership of 1975 was about 280,000–290,000.

⁵⁰ Cheung, *Let Your Heart Be Bold*, 33–41.

⁵¹ Interview with Fr. Aquilino Miquélez, SJ, at Zhudong 竹東, Taiwan, March 21, 2004.