Globethics Repository



A teologia de José Bates acerca da expiação e salvação [The theology of Joseph Bates about atonement and salvation]

This page was generated automatically upon download from the Globethics Repository. More information on Globethics see https://www.globethics.net. Data and content policy of Globethics Repository see https://repository.globethics.net/pages/policy.

Item Type	Article
Authors	Zukowski, Jean Carlos
Publisher	Centro Universitário Adventista de São Paulo (Unasp)
Rights	Creative Commons Copyright (CC 2.5)
Download date	2026-11-12 12:10:18
Link to Item	http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.12424/228854

Ano 6 - Número 2 - 2º. Semestre de 2010
www.unasp.edu.br/kerygma
pp.4-31

ARTIGOS

JOSEPH BATES ON ATONEMENT AND SALVATION

Jean Carlos Zukowski, Dr.
Professor de História do Cristianismo
da Faculdade Adventista de Teologia do
Centro Universitário Adventista de São Paulo (Unasp)
jean.zukowski@unasp.edu.br

Abstract: This study analyzes the understanding of Joseph Bates, one of the main pioneers of movement the Seventh-day Adventist, on the doctrine of atonement in the plan of salvation. All his theology is consigned in a prophetic schema that makes necessary to study his understanding on atonement and salvation within this structure. He saw both atonement and salvation as a process and not as a punctual act. For Bates, the work of Christ in favor of humanity is done in two stages, the first being the forgiveness of sins and the last their purification. The pioneer was not concern in explaining this process of atonement in two stages, because for him salvation and full atonement were an integral part of the great prophetic historical context of the conflict between good and evil. Bates defended the importance of the obedience to God's law, especially in the time of the end, for the process of purification of the character; but he believed that man is saved by grace and not by the obedience to the law.

Keywords: Joseph Bates; Salvation; Atonement.

A TEOLOGIA DE JOSÉ BATES ACERCA DA EXPIAÇÃO E SALVAÇÃO

Resumo: Este estudo analisa o entendimento de José Bates, um dos principais pioneiros do movimento Adventista do Sétimo Dia, referente a doutrina da expiação no plano da salvação. Toda sua teologia é colocada em um esquema profético fazendo necessário estudar seu entendimento em expiação e salvação dentro desta estrutura, pois ele via tanto a expiação como a salvação como sendo um processo e não um ato pontilhar. Para Bates, o trabalho de Cristo em favor da humanidade é feito em duas fases sendo a primeira o perdão dos pecados e a última a purificação dos mesmos. O pioneiro não se preocupava em explicar este processo de expiação em duas fases, pois colocava salvação e expiação como parte integral do grande contexto histórico profético no conflito entre o bem e o mal. Bates defendia a importância da obediência à lei de Deus principalmente no tempo do fim neste trabalho de purificação de caráter, mas cria que o homem é salvo pela graça e não pela obediência da lei.

Palavras-chave: José Bates; salvação; expiação.

1. Introduction

Joseph Bates, James and Ellen White are considered the founding leaders of the Seventh-day Adventist Church. Captain Bates, due to his significant role in the formation of the Adventist movement has been considered as the real founder of Adventism.[1] He is well known today as the "apostle of the Sabbath truth," [2] the "Outrider of the Apocalypse"[3] and the temperance reformer.[4] His contact with William Miller's[5] views on the second coming of Jesus led him to become a careful student of Bible prophecies and an enthusiastic evangelist.

The three aspects above mentioned (Sabbath, prophecies, and Health reform) about Joseph Bates have been extensively explored in Adventists literature.[6] However, his theological

[1] George R. Knight, *Joseph Bates: The Real Founder of Seventh-Day Adventism* (Hagerstown, MD: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 2004), ix.

[2] Virgil E. Robinson, *Cabin Boy to Advent Crusader* (Nashville: Southern Publishing Association, 1960), 119-124.

[3] Godfrey Tryggve Anderson, *Outrider of the Apocalypse: Life and Times of Joseph Bates* (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1972).

[4] Wayne Judd, "Father Bates's Story," *Adventist Heritage*, Summer 1975, 64. Even though he was the oldest of the Adventist pioneers, N. Gordon Thomas states that "he remained remarkably free from serious illness at a time when younger Adventist leaders were patients at health resorts." "Joseph Bates - Adventist Pilgrim Father," *Adventist Review*, 26 November 1987, 12.

[5] William Miller is considered the founder of the Millerite or Second Advent Movement of America. Studying Bible prophecies he came to the conclusion that Jesus second coming was near. He formulated fourteen rules of Bible interpretation. The conclusions of Miller's prophetical studies are: "1. The popular view of a temporal millennium before the second advent, and the end of the age, was a fallacy. 2. The theory of the return of the Jews was not sustained by the Word. 3. Jesus will come again personally, with all the holy angels with Him. 4. The kingdom of God will be established at that coming. 5. The earth will perish in a deluge of fire. 6. The new earth will spring forth out of its ashes. 7. The righteous dead will be resurrected at the advent. 8. The wicked dead will not come forth until the close of the thousand years. 9. The papal Little Horn will be destroyed at the advent. 10. We are living in the last phase of the outline prophecies —such as, in Daniel 2, in the period of the 'feet and toes.' 11. All prophetic time periods—such as the 70 weeks, the 1260 days, and the rest—are to be computed on the year-day principle. 12. The 2300 year-days, extending from 457 B.C. to about A.D. 1843, will bring the climax of prophecy and of human history; and that Jesus will come 'on or before' the Jewish year '1843.'"Le Roy Edwin Froom, *The Prophetic Faith of Our Fathers; the Historical Development of Prophetic Interpretation*, 4 vols. (Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald, 1946-1954), 4:463.

[6] See for example: Anderson; Joseph Bates, *The Autobiography of Elder Joseph Bates: Embracing a Long Life on Shipboard, with Sketches of Voyages on the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans, the Baltic and Mediterranean Seas, Also Impressment and Service on Board British War Ships, Long Confinement in Dartmoor Prison, Early Experience in Reformatory Movements; Travels in Various Parts of the World and a Brief Account of the Great Advent Movement of 1840-44* (Battle Creek: Steam Press of the Seventh-day Adventist Publishing Association, 1868); Joseph Bates and Clarence Creager Crisler, *Life of Joseph Bates: An Autobiography* (Takoma Park, Washington, DC: Review and Herald Pub. Association, 1927); Joseph Bates and James White, *Early Life and Later Experience and Labors of Elder Joseph Bates* (Battle Creek, MI: Press of the Seventh-day adventist publishing association, 1877); George Burton Boundey, "Spiritual Lineage from James White and Joseph Bates to George Boundey" (Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1977); Mark L. Bovee, "Pioneers in the History of This

contributions for Sabbatarian Adventism have not been explored comprehensively. George knight's recent biography, *Joseph Bates: The real Founder of Seventh-day Adventists,* has started to fill the gap on Bates theological contribution to Adventism. He points to Bates as the first Adventist theologian and tells how Bates set the foundation of our understanding of theology as history. Among other subjects, some aspects of Bates's understanding on salvation are discussed in fifth section. However, Bates's understanding on atonement is not explored as a specific subject in the book.

Since few works have been done on Bates's explicit theological points of view, the purpose of this article is to analyze in Joseph Bates's writings his understanding on atonement and salvation. Bates did not write any particular article or book on salvation or atonement. Sabbath, prophecies, and typology are the main subjects in his works. His main focus continued to be the perfect synchronism between Bible prophecy and history following Miller's historical method of prophetic interpretation.[7] Since all his theological contributions were interrelated with prophetic understandings, it is essential to explain Bates's eschatology before analyzing any other aspect of his theology.

Atonement and salvation will be discussed in the following way in this article: after a general introduction to the research presented in the first section, the second section will describe Bates eschatology pointing out the different phases of the development of his prophetic understanding. The third section will analyze Bates's understanding on covenant, sin, and salvation. The fourth

---

Denomination" (Term Paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary); Everett Newfon Dick, *Founders of the Message* (Takoma Park, Washington DC: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1938); Sadie Owen Engen and James Converse, *God Set the Sails* (Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1982); Timothy Edwin Henderson, "Joseph Bates, Health Reformer" (Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1977); "Historical Notes from the Land of Joseph Bates -- New Bedford and Fairhaven Massachusetts, James White Library; James Joiner, *These Were the Courageous* (Nashville: Southern Pub. Association, 1968); Veikko Olavi Leppanen, "Itineraries of Joseph Bates in 1849-56" (Photographic reproduction of typescript copy, Andrews University Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1975); C. Mervyn Maxwell, "Joseph Bates and Seventh-Day Adventist Sabbath Theology" (Typescript copy, 1977); Kenneth Randolph Riley, "An Investigation into Whether Joseph Bates, E. G. White or F. M. Wilcox Taught Sabbath Observance as a Means of Salvation" (Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1966); Robinson; Clarence Edwin Stenberg, "A Study of the Influence of Joseph Bates on the Denomination of Seventh-Day Adventists" (Thesis, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1950); Kenneth Wadworth, "Joseph Bates" (Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1971); Carl R. Wilcox, "The Travels of Joseph Bates" (Term paper, Andrews University, Undergraduate Colleges, 1964).

[7] See appendix 1.

section will analyze Bates's typology. The Jewish annual feasts and their correspondent applications to the plan of salvation will be explored. The section will describe Bates's understanding of atonement based on his typological biblical scheme. Finally a summary and conclusion will be presented.

2. Prophecy and History

Joseph Bates's theology is found mainly in his six books–*The Opening Heavens (1846); Second Advent Way Marks and High Heaps; An Explanation of the Typical and Anti-Typical Sanctuary, by the Scriptures; The Seventh Day Sabbath, a Perpetual Sign, from the Beginning to the Entering into the Gates of the Holy City, According to the Commandment (first and second edition); A Vindication of the Seventh-Day Sabbath, and the Commandments of God: with a Further History of God's Peculiar People, from 1847 to 1848*–and from some articles and pamphlets. His works follow the Millerite historical prophetic method of biblical interpretation.

To understand his works properly it is necessary to describe the Millerite movement, a little. In this section Bates's involvement in the Millerite movement will be presented, then the principal historical events and prophetic framework of the Millerite preaching that resulted in the great disappointment, and finally Bates's new insights on prophetic understanding will be analyzed.

2.1 Historical Background

Joseph Bates spent most of his life as a sailor. His conversion occurred while he was a captain and had listened to Miller's preaching on the imminent coming of Jesus.[8] His Christian and health reform convictions led him to engage actively in health reform and anti-slavery societies.[9] After his acceptance of Miller's preaching on the second coming of Jesus, he started to dedicate most of his time as a leader of the Millerite movement.

The Millerite movement was characterized by its understanding of Bible prophecies, which led their leaders to proclaim the imminent return of Christ to earth. Miller's interpretation of

[8] Bates, *Autobiography*, 181-192.
[9] Ibid., 205, 230-241.

Daniel's prophecies, mainly Daniel 8:14–"Unto two thousand and three hundred days; then shall the sanctuary be cleansed"[10]–set the basis for his beliefs in the soon return of Jesus Christ to earth. For Miller, the sanctuary to be cleansed was the earth, and the cleansing of the earth was the final elimination of sin from this world. Since the second coming of Jesus to earth is the biblical event when all earth will be purified from sin, he concluded that the end of the prophetic period of the 2300 days would culminate with the second coming of Jesus to earth. Miller, based on the day-year principle,[11] understood that the end of the prophetic period of the 2300 days would occur around 1843.

Beyond the 2300 days prophecy, other Bible passages received special attention from the Millerite movement. From these passages they applied specific terminologies to identify the different prophetic periods.

2.1.1 Prophetic Terminologies and the Disappointment

The most common terminologies used by the Millerites were: time of the end, judgment hour and midnight cry. The expression 'the time of the end' was taken from Dan. 12:4 and 9, and for the Millerite leaders and Bates had its beginning at the end of the 1260 days prophetic period in 1798.[12] The judgment hour was the period from 1798 to 1843, the accepted date at that time for the second coming of Jesus. Josiah Litch[13] presented the judgment in two phases: judicial and

[10] Unless specified in the paper all the Bible quotations will be from the King James Version.

[11] According to the historicists in Bible prophecies, when apocalyptical chronological events are predicted the correspondent number of days appointed by the prophecy must be understood as years. One day in prophecy covers the period of one year. For further studies in the day-year principle see Albert Barnes, *Book of Revelation: With a Prefatory Essay on the Year-Day Principle*, [Illustrated annotated edition] ed. (London: Blackie, 1832); Paul A. Gordon, *Pioneer Articles: On the Sanctuary, Daniel 8:14, the Judgment, 2300 Days, Year-Day Principle, Atonement, 1846-1905* (Washington, D.C.: Ellen G. White Estate, 1983); William H. Shea, "The Year-Day Principle: The Reckoning of Time in Apocalyptic Prophecy, 1981," Typescript.

[12] P. Gerard Damsteegt, *Foundations of the Seventh-Day Adventist Message and Mission* (Berrien Springs, Mich.: Andrews University Press, 1988); C. Mervyn Maxwell and P. Gerard Damsteegt, *Source Book for the Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology*, Rev. ed. (1989), 20-25.

[13] Dr. Josiah Litch (1809–1886). Litch was a well-known minister in the New England Methodist Conference. He was born in Higham, Massachusetts, and joined the Methodist Episcopal Church at his conversion, at the age of 17. He accept Miller's prophetic interpretation and became an active leader of the movement. He wrote books and articles that helped the spreading of the Millerite message. He lectured in many places about the Millerite prophetic interpretation, and he was one of the leading editors of the Millerite paper, The Signs of the Times. Ken McGaughey, *Seventh-Day Adventist Roots* [On line Magazine] (1998, accessed April 1 2004); available from http://www.steps2life.org/php/view_article.php?article_id=1079.

a penal executive. The judicial was in progress since 1798 and had two dimensions, a trial for the dead and for the living. The penal executive judgment was associated with the second coming of Jesus and the resurrection.[14] The midnight cry was an expression taken from the parable of the ten virgins of Matthews 25. It was first understood as the urgent necessity of preaching the message of the second coming in a time where everybody was sleeping–not aware of the nearness of the second coming of Jesus.[15] After the first disappointment, it was identified with proclamation "behold, the bridegroom is coming" in the tarrying time of the period between spring-autumn of 1844. This period was called the true midnight cry of the seventh month movement.[16]

The Millerite movement had set the year 1843 for the second coming of Jesus, but a more accurate analysis of the Jewish calendar led them to fix October 22, 1844 as the end of the 2300 days period. However, on the appointed date Jesus did not come. Many Adventist believers were disappointed and gave up their historical prophetic understanding. However, some of them continued studying the Bible seeking for more light. They believed in the accuracy of the prophetic chronology, but were looking for answers regarding what kind of event had occurred at the end of the prophetic 2300 days.[17]

2.2 Bates Prophetic Outline After 1844

Joseph Bates was part of those who continued believing in the correctness of the prophetic chronology. For him all Millerite Adventist interpretations–for example: the seven churches, the midnight cry, the shut door–were correct except what should take place at the end of the 2300 days. The second coming of Jesus to earth continued to be an imminent event to him. His discovering of the Sabbath and a deeper study of the priestly ministry of the earthly sanctuary led

[14] Damsteegt, *Foundations*, 45-46; P. Gerard Damsteegt, *Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology an Outline* (Berrien Springs, MI: Christian Heritage Media, 1995), 17.

[15] Miller interpretation of the parable in the context of the proclamation of the first angel message was as follow: ten virgins, humanity in general; the lamps, word of God; the oil, faith; the bridegroom, Christ; the Marriage, Christ's coming to earth to marriage His church; the midnight cry, the ignorance of the people about the second coming of Jesus; the trimming of the lights, the distribution of the Bibles by tract societies, missionary societies, Sabbath schools, and Bible classes; the shut door, the closing of the door of mercy or probation. Damsteegt, *Foundations*, 40-45; Damsteegt, *Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology an Outline*, 17.

[16] Damsteegt, *Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology an Outline*, 27.

[17] Damsteegt, *Foundations*, 99-115; Damsteegt, *Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology an Outline*, 25.

him to see in the end of the 2300 days, the beginning of Jesus ministration in the Most Holy Place of the heavenly sanctuary. For him the Bible was not contradictory to itself. All Bible students should be careful in their research to allow the clearness of the Bible to explain itself.

2.2.1 The Second Coming, the New Jerusalem and the Sanctuary

After the disappointment Bates wrote a book[18] confirming his belief in the correctness of the biblical chronology. In response to those who spiritualized the second coming of Jesus,[19] he affirms his belief in the literal second coming of Jesus and consequently in the implementation of His everlasting kingdom on the renewed earth. He states to "believe [that] he [Jesus] is in the third Heaven, in Paradise, with God, the Father; (see 2 Cor. 12:2,4; Rev. 3:21; Heb. 1:3,9 and 24) that he is now about to come with the Holy CITY, THE CAPITAL of his everlasting kingdom, and locate it in the 'midst' of the promised land where he was crucified."[20] He identifies this New Jerusalem as a literal city, the place where God dwells, and God's sanctuary. He quotes many Bible verses to prove that Moses' tabernacle was a figure of the true heavenly tabernacle. He uses many biblical heavenly descriptions, where the same furniture present in the earthly tabernacle is present in the heavenly one. He presents Jesus as our High Priest working in our behalf in this heavenly sanctuary.[21] He quotes Ezekiel 37 to prove the necessity of the "place"–God's temple on earth–applying it to the coming down of the New Jerusalem to earth after the second coming of Jesus. He sometimes presents the whole city as the Sanctuary and other times a part of the city as the sanctuary. [22]

2.2.2 2300 Days Prophecy

Since Miller believed in the correctness of the prophetic chronology, Bates did not question the beginning and end proposed by the Millerites–457 AC to 1844 AD–for the prophetic

[18] Joseph Bates, *The Opening Heavens or, a Connected View of the Testimony of the Prophets and Apostles, Concerning the Opening Heavens, Compared with Astronomical Observations, and of the Present and Future Location of the New Jerusalem, the Paradise of God* (New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1846).
[19] For more details on the Millerite historical accounts post-disappointment see Knight, 71-74.
[20] Bates, *The Opening Heavens*, 3.
[21] More details of his understanding on Christ ministry in the heavenly sanctuary will be given in chapter IV.
[22] Bates, *The Opening Heavens*, 25-39.

period of the 2300 days of Daniel 8:14. As the fulfillment of the prophecy, he presents Jesus' two-phase ministry in the heavenly sanctuary. Christ's ascension to heaven after His resurrection is pointed out by him as the beginning of His mediation in the first part of the sanctuary–the Holy place. The cleansing of the sanctuary, predicted by the prophecy took place when Jesus entered in the second room of the heavenly sanctuary, the Most Holy Place, to do the work of judgment after 1844.[23]

2.2.3 The Ten Virgins

Bates relates Daniel 7:9, 10, and 13 with the coming of the Bridegroom in the parable of the ten virgins. The coming of the Son of Man to the Ancient of Days of Daniel he understood as Jesus, the Bridegroom, coming to the wedding to receive His kingdom. This was the coronation of Jesus as King of Israel and the beginning of His work of judgment not His second coming to earth. After this work of judgment He would come to gather His people in the clouds of heavens.[24]

In the first years after the disappointment he believed that only those who had participated in the Millerite movement and were waiting for the Second Coming of Jesus in 1844 would go in with Jesus to the marriage. When Jesus entered in the Most Holy place to cleanse the sanctuary the door was shut.[25] However, for those who had left the apocalyptic church of Sardis and were part of the church of Philadelphia the door was open. According to him, Jesus had opened a door for the Philadelphian church that nobody could close.[26] This understanding limited Adventist missiology (in the first years after the disappointment) to those who participated in the Millerite movement. Later on, Bates changed his position in the shut door belief.[27]

[23] Joseph Bates, "The Holy Sabbath," *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, April 7 1851, 8-9. More details on Christ' two-phase ministry will be given in chapter IV.
[24] Ibid., 9-11.
[25] Ibid.
[26] Ibid., 13-15.
[27] George Knight says that Bates changed his opinion on the shut door belief only after 1852 when David Hewitt–a non participant in the Millerite movement–converted listening to Bates' preaching. Knight, 132.

2.2.4 The Seven Churches and the Three Angels Message

The Sabbath truth opened a new door for Bates to interpret the three angels messages, the sealing of the 144,000, and to explain why Jesus did not return to earth in 1844. In the beginning Bates maintained the same interpretation of the Millerite movement on the Three Angel messages. He continued interpreting the preaching of Jesus second coming by Miller and others after 1840 as the fulfillment of the first angel's message; the nominal churches rejection of the first message as the fulfillment of the second angel's message, and the calling for all people to leave Babylon and be prepared for the Advent of Jesus as the third message.[28]

Bates's new insights in Revelation 14 are connected with his understanding of verses 12-14. He saw a singular characteristic of those who would be prepared to meet Jesus in His second coming–they had the testimony of Jesus and kept the commandments of God.

For Bates, the Sabbath truth should be restored before Jesus second coming. The Sabbath was the seal of the living God which the 144,000 would receive. Bates posits that

> When the 144,000 on the earth, individually, keep God's Holy Sabbath according to the commandment, see the examples in Luke 23:56, and decalogue, Exo. 20:8-10, then the sign of that Sabbath is manifest, and this sign will be a seal of their righteous act and faith, as circumcision was to faithful Abraham, Rom. 4:11, and the act ratified, by their being 'sealed by the holy spirit of promise unto the day of redemption'.[29]

Bates shut and open door understanding after 1844 led him to see those who participated in the Millerite movement but after the disappointment had abandoned the historicist prophetic interpretation as the Laodicean church. For him, only these Millerites had an open door, a new opportunity to turn back to the Philadelphia church, accept the commandment of God–the Sabbath–and doing that to be prepared to meet Jesus at his imminent second coming. He states that

> the seventh state is the Laodicean, organized by those who left the Philadelphia after the 2300 days, the appointed time, had ended. Hosea describes all their converts, v. 7. This is the state which the great head of the church is laboring to disband and dissolve: 3:14-21; see particularly 19th verse. Repent (and turn to the Philadelphia) for there is no other

[28] Joseph Bates, *Second Advent Way Marks and High Heaps : Or a Connected View of the Fulfilment of Prophecy, by God's Peculiar People, from the Year 1840-1847* (New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1847), 45-67.
[29] Joseph Bates, *A Seal of the Living God. A Hundred Forty-Four Thousand, of the Servants of God Being Sealed, in 1849* (New Bedford, MA: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1849), 36.

> state of the Church since 1844, where the new commandment can be kept: John 13:34,35. Bible definition shows it to be the state or church of brotherly love."[30]

In this context Bates presented the Sabbath as the present truth, the sealing message, and its acceptance or rejection essential to salvation for those who were part of the Laodicean church. Bates was always open to receive further light from the Word of God. His later understanding on the three angel messages was influenced by James White. He saw the three messages not one following the other, but beginning in different times and continuing until the atonement in heaven be ended. He added to the third angel's message Revelation 14:12.[31] Bates explain also that the open door was for those who not participate in the Millerite Experience.

2.3 Summary

Bates kept the same prophetic framework of the Millerite movement. However, he had new understandings about the end of the 2300 days and other Bible prophecies. He believed in the chronologic accuracy of the 2300 days prophecy. He believed that this prophecy had its beginning in 457 BC and its end in 1844 AD. He believed that in 1844 Jesus came to the Father as Bridegroom to be crowned and begin His ministry of judgment in the Most Holy place of the heavenly sanctuary. He believed that the Sabbath was the seal of God and that it should be restored before the second coming of Jesus in fulfillment of the third angel's message. He believed that the Sabbath will be the sign that will differentiate God's peculiar people, the 144,000, before Jesus second Advent. Before he gave up that the shutting of the door of mercy happened in 1844, he believed that only those who participated in the Millerite movement had an open door for new development on the Bible truth and could be saved.

3. Covenant, Sin, and Salvation

After the disappointment Bates came to the conclusion that the missing point in the Millerite view of God's salvific plan delineated through out prophetic timeline was Jesus two phases work of atonement in the heavenly sanctuary. The cleansing of the sanctuary was part of the second

[30] Joseph Bates, *An Explanation of the Typical and Anti-Typical Sanctuary by the Scriptures, with a Chart* (New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1850), 13.
[31] Bates, *Autobiography*, 295-306.

phase and had implications both in heaven and earth. While in heaven Jesus was performing the work of judgment, on earth God's people should be purified. The main point of this special work of purification on earth was for Bates the unfolding of all biblical truth, specially the keeping of the Sabbath. The rejection of the Sabbath was for him the rejection of the present truth. This led Bates to preach the Sabbath as essential to salvation for the last people of God on earth.

Bates emphasis on Sabbath observance led some Adventists that had abandoned the historicist way of interpreting the Bible to accuse him of being a legalist. To better understand Bates' concepts on salvation and atonement in this section his views on covenant, sin, and salvation will be discussed. His views on atonement will be the topic for the next section.

3.1 Bates on Covenants

Bates presents in his works two explanations on covenant. He talks about covenant as four everlasting covenants, and he comes up with the Ten Commandments as God's covenant. The fact that he declares the Ten Commandments as God's covenant does not mean that it is a fifth one. He has the Ten Commandments as the base of all covenants.

3.1.1 Four covenants

Bates says that the Bible presents God's four everlasting covenants with humanity. He presents the Sabbath as one of these everlasting covenants. He describes it as the fourth covenant and the one that, if observed faithfully, can validate the other ones. He describes the four covenants in the following way:

> 1. Is the covenant of inheritance 'confirmed unto Jacob for a law, and unto Israel for an everlasting inheritance.' - Psalms 105:8-12. Acts 7:3-6. Eph. 1:14.
> 2. Is an everlasting covenant of redemption. 'I have made a covenant with my chosen; I have sworn unto David my servant. - His seed shall endure forever, and his throne as the sun before me. It shall be established forever as the moon, and as a faithful witness in heaven.' - Psl. 89:3,36,37. Heb. 9:12,15. Eternal redemption.
> 3. Is an everlasting covenant of peace. 'Behold I give unto him my covenant of peace; even the covenant of an everlasting priesthood.' Num. 25:12,13. Eze. 20:37. 37:26, my covenant of peace shall be an everlasting covenant.
> Now mark! These three eternal, and everlasting covenants are conditional to God's children here, and are yet in the future; and can only be inherited by the living saints in

> the future, by keeping the 4th everlasting covenant. It is not the 4th or last in order in the Bible, I have merely called it so in this explanation.[32]

In the first covenant–covenant of inheritance–Bates includes the Ten Commandments and all other ordinances related with the sanctuary services. In the second covenant–covenant of redemption–he includes the Ten Commandments, but now no ordinances are established because it is established in better promises, Jesus is the mediator of this new covenant. The first covenant is still everlasting for Bates when he considers that the true Israel will inherit the promise land, the New Jerusalem.[33]

The third covenant he identifies with the first covenant when the presence of God through the temple was with Israel. He states it as an everlasting covenant and not limited to the Jews. The presence of God is part of the second covenant through Jesus Christ now on earth and in the future in the New Jerusalem. In this way he links this third covenant with the second one. With the fourth covenant–Sabbath keeping–he makes the same connection. It was part of the first as well as the second.[34]

3.2 The Definition of Sin

Bates understanding on salvation is connected with his definition of sin. He defines sin as transgression of the law. In his explanation about the Sabbath not being a shadow of Christ, he gave the following definition of sin: "But the weekly Sabbath, that never was given for a feast day as the above were, is not a shadow, neither can it be unless all of God's commandments are shadows. If they are shadows, then of course they are blotted out, and there can be no sin. 'For sin is the transgression of the law.' 'Where no law is, there is no transgression.' This settles the question forever."[35]

For Bates, any kind of sin that was not confessed would be enough to keep somebody out of heaven. However, he is clear in presenting that God through Jesus can forgive any confessed sin. "Under the gospel, God for Jesus' sake gives the Sabbath-breaker, and all other sinners space

[32] Bates, *Seal of the Living God*, 59-60.
[33] Joseph Bates, *A Vindication of the Seventh-Day Sabbath and the Commandments of God : With a Further History of God's Peculiar People from 1847-1848* (New Bedford, MA: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1848), 50-51.
[34] Ibid., 50-53; Bates, *Seal of the Living God*, 59-61.
[35] Joseph Bates, "New Testament Seventh Day Sabbath," *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, January 1851, 31-32.

for repentance"[36] "My limited views of conversion, and strong desire not to be deceived in this important matter, caused me to overlook the simple manner in which God graciously condescends to pardon the guilty, pleading sinner."[37]

3.3 The meaning of Salvation

Bates has statements on Sabbath and salvation like "Much more is said about it than any doctrine in the Bible, beginning in Genesis, and continuing down to the closing up of the last message which God ever gave to man, proving clearly that the continuing doing of these commandments saves the soul," "the keeping of GOD'S SABBATH HOLY, GOD'S SANCTIFIES AND SAVES THE SOUL!,"[38] that links salvation with Sabbath keeping. Was Bates teaching salvation by works through these statements? What was Bates concept on salvation?

Bates's views on salvation are connected to the context in which he preached his messages. Bates was preaching for those who were living in a specific prophetic time. In section one was presented that for him the door of mercy was shut for those who had rejected the Millerite message and a door was open by Jesus for those who had not rejected this message. The special message for these believers in the second coming was the restoration of all truth, which included the keeping of the Sabbath. Bates posits that God is calling His remnant people to make a covenant with Him and be sanctified and prepared to overcome in the last time of probation.
The covenant for those who lived after 1844 is based on the law of God and the testimony of Jesus. This is not a covenant of acceptance of Jesus as savior. However, because of the specific time that they live, those who do not meet the conditions of this covenant–for example the keeping of Sabbath–can lose their salvation. Bates says:

> All that are saved now, must keep the commandments of God, in accordance with the third angel's message. - Rev.xiv,12. No matter how much else we do, if this third and last message is unheeded, we cannot be saved, any more than those who are now condemned for rejecting the first and second messages in verses 6-8. When the Master of the house (the Lord Jesus) rose up and shut to the door, all honest believers, that had submitted to his will, and children that had not arrived to the years of accountability, were undoubtedly

[36] Bates, "The Holy Sabbath," 57.
[37] Bates, *Autobiography*, 203.
[38] Bates, *Vindication of the Seventh-Day Sabbath*, iii, 55.

> borne in on his breast-plate of judgment which is over his heart. - The names of all that fully keep the commandments are retained. These that do not, will have their names erased before Jesus leaves the Holiest.[39]

Bates says also that the Sabbath covenant is a test for God's people before Jesus comes to earth. For those who reject the chronological understanding of the 2300 days and the Sabbath message he affirms that Jesus cannot save them.

> We say, that as long as they continue rebellious against their lawful Prince, it is morally impossible for them to beget for him one peaceful subject. God has a true test, by which to try every individual since the Midnight Cry. It is 'the commandments of God and the faith of Jesus,' Rev.xiv,9-12. […] I entreat you, seize the glimmering light of salvation, that is about to be forever extinguished from this guilty world. Grasp it with all your soul, and might, and mind. Plead with the blessed Jesus, for immortality and eternal life. Talk about searching out sinners, that the work of the Midnight Cry left in outer darkness six years ago! He will not save you, if you do not quickly flee from the dreadful snare you are now in.[40]

For him the major problem is voluntary disobedience, not accidental acts of sin. According to his definition of sin–transgression of the law–a sinner that persists in sin cannot be saved. He says:

> The test, for keeping them to obtain eternal life, is found in this verse also. For he says, 'Whosoever shall violate, or teach others to violate,' 'shall be in no esteem in the reign of heaven.' But all such as 'practice and teach them, shall be highly esteemed in the reign of heaven.' We cannot be made 'kings and priests unto God,' unless we are esteemed; therefore, all such as *knowingly* violate God's commandments, will not reign in heaven.[41]

Bates declares the Sabbath a test for God's people at the end time. Nevertheless, he sees possibility of salvation for those who do not come to the knowledge of the Sabbath message and for the children of believers. He says, "it is true, some persons that are ignorant of this message may, and undoubtedly will be saved if they die before Jesus leaves the Holiest."[42]

The obedience of the law is not what gives salvation for the doers, but Jesus death on the cross. For him the law is only a guide to eternal life. It comes after salvation. He says: "Respecting the questions of the young man, and the lawyer, Jesus told them, that the way to enter into eternal life, was by keeping the commandments. How shall we ever find the way there,

[39] Joseph Bates, "Duty to Our Children," *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, January 1851, 39.
[40] Joseph Bates, "Midnight Cry in the Past," *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, December 1850, 24.
[41] Joseph Bates, "New Testament Testimony," *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, November 1850, 11. [Emphases mine.]
[42] Bates, "Duty to Our Children," 39.

if there are none? Did our blessed Lord die to save men, and then point out such a path to walk in? No, no. He gave us the whole law of God to guide us into eternal life, and man cannot find any other way."[43]

Bates conversion history is important when his views on salvation are discussed. He wrote his autobiography at the end of his life. If he believed at that time in salvation by works he would present it in his biography. The following quotations taken from his biography are important to clarify his understanding on salvation.

First he states forgiveness of sin and salvation without mention of works. "This was the 30th of September, twenty-six days from the capes of Virginia. From thence I felt a sinking into the will of God, resolving henceforward to renounce the unfruitful works of the enemy, and seek carefully for eternal life. I believe now that all my sins were forgiven about that time."[44] He says of full and free salvation. "I was much disappointed also in not finding one professor of religion to converse with, among the many thousands of people here, but I was fully resolved to persevere for a full and free salvation."[45]

Bates made a covenant with God that is symbol of his understanding of salvation.

> Eternal and ever-blessed God: I desire to present myself before thee with the deepest humiliation and abasement of soul. Sensible how unworthy such a sinful worm is to appear before the Holy Majesty of Heaven, the King of kings and Lord of lords, […] I come therefore acknowledging myself to have been a great offender. Smiting on my breast and saying with the humble publican, 'God be merciful to me a sinner,' […] this day do I with the utmost solemnity surrender myself to thee. I renounce all former lords that have had dominion over me, and I consecrate to thee all that I am, and all that I have. […] Use me, O Lord, I beseech thee, as an instrument of thy service, number me among thy peculiar people. Let me be washed in the blood of thy dear Son. To whom, with thee, O Father, be everlasting praises ascribed, by all the millions who are thus saved by thee. Amen.[46]

Bates remarks on his understanding of the covenant words at the time he wrote his biography demonstrate how much he believed in those words, because the words were more solemn for him at that time than when he had pronounced them years before. He says:

[43] Bates, "New Testament Testimony," 11.
[44] Bates, *Autobiography*, 184.
[45] Ibid., 186.
[46] Ibid., 185.

> I wish that I could always have the resignation to the will of God that I felt the morning that I signed this covenant. Yet I could not believe then, nor for many months after this, that I had any other feelings than a deep conviction for sin. I am satisfied that I have not always regarded this covenant in the solemn light in which I now understand it. But I am very glad I made it, and that God has still spared my life to allow me yet to do all that I therein covenanted to do.[47]

Bates states that God graciously conceded pardon.

> For something like eighteen months I had been unwilling to believe that the Lord had forgiven me my sins, because I had been looking for some evidence, or manifestation of his power, (I did not know how or in what manner), which would convince me beyond a doubt. My limited views of conversion, and strong desire not to be deceived in this important matter, caused me to overlook the simple manner in which God graciously condescends to pardon the guilty, pleading sinner.
> After meeting, my tongue was loosed to praise God for what he had done for me so many months before. From this time, All doubts and darkness respecting my conversion and acceptance with God, passed away like the morning dew, and peace like a river, for weeks and months occupied my heart and mind. I could now give a reason of the hope within me, and say with the apostle, 'We know that we have passed from death unto life because we love the brethren.' 'Old things are passed away; behold all things are become new.' 1John iii,14; 2Cor.v,17.[48]

Bates connected conversion and salvation with change of life. He not only kept it for himself, but decided to put it as a rule–the Christian principles–on his boat. He forbade swearing, washing or mending clothes on Sunday, liquor on board, and stimulated good fellowship and God's worship on board. For him, salvation was freely offered by God, but the Christian responsibility was to be in covenant with God and avoid sin, that he stated to be the transgression of the law of God.[49]

4. Type, Anti-Type and Atonement

The great disappointment led Joseph Bates to do a deeper study of the whole sacrificial system of the OT tabernacle. The annual feasts of the Israelites were understood by Bates as shadows of Christ's ministry on earth and in heaven. He gave special attention to the three main

[47] Ibid.
[48] Ibid., 203.
[49] Ibid., 209-212.

feasts of the Mosaic law: Passover, Pentecost, and the Tabernacle which the Day of Atonement was associated. He pointed out that the same exactness of the fulfillment of the two first feasts–Passover and Pentecost–in Jesus ministry on earth should be repeated in all other types, mainly the third feast–the Tabernacles.

In his exposition of the biblical typology, Bates presents a solid understanding of the atonement connected with the sacrificial system of the OT. He presents two kinds of atonement: daily atonement and national atonement. In this section it will be explored how he connects the sanctuary ministrations of the OT with Jesus ministry, and his understanding of the atonement.

4.1 Ministration on Earth and in the Holy Place

Bates had a biblical view where God's plan was perfectly presented in symbols and types. For him the lack of understanding of biblical typology of many of the previous leaders of the Millerite movement was not in the biblical types, but in their limitations to comprehend God's word. He saw in the death of Christ on the cross the fulfillment of the lamb sacrificed in the Passover. He presented the whole feast of Passover as being fulfilled in the cross, and as proof of the correctness of Bible typology. He says: "Just see how perfectly to the very hour of the day our Savior fulfilled the type of the passover, about 1500 years from its commencement, at 3 o'clock in the afternoon, on the 14th day of the first month. Surely not one jot of the law failed here."[50] He used the pouring out of the Holy Spirit on the day of the Pentecost as another event to support his position.

> Again, 50 days after this [Passover], the anniversary of the giving of the law by God to Moses at Sinai, called the feast of weeks, was fulfilled by the Holy Ghost descending like a rushing mighty wind, and as cloven tongues of fire. Here too was antitype answering to type. Here then are two feasts out of three entirely and forever fulfilled in this state."[51]

Bates emphases on the exact fulfillment of the first two feasts of the OT, Passover and Pentecost, was to show the necessity of a typological day of atonement to take place according to the biblical Israelite festival cycle. He says:

> The first at the Passover, second 50 days after or the Pentecost, third and last seventh month at the ingathering of the harvest. Now here were types to be fulfilled as clearly as those which had already been, and my solemn conviction is that the feast of Tabernacles

[50] Bates, *Way Marks*, 80.
[51] Ibid.

> at the ingathering of the harvest is to be fulfilled here by the ingathering of the whole Israel of God.[52]

Since all the feasts and sanctuary sacrifices were a shadow of Christ for him, Christ's ministry on earth and heaven should be explained according to the priesthood, sacrifices, and feasts of the old tabernacle.

4.1.1 The Earthly Ministration

Bates emphasized the sacrificial aspects of Jesus earthly ministry. All the daily sacrifices offered in the earthly sanctuary are for him a symbol of Jesus death on the cross. He connects Jesus death not only with the daily sacrifices, but also with the Passover feast. The same way that in the Passover God delivered His people from Egypt, Jesus was the Lamb of God that was dead to deliver His people from sin.[53] He posits an exact fulfillment between the type and antitype when he applies the Passover to Jesus earthly ministry. He says:

> The time in which God delivered his people from Egypt, about 3440 years ago, they were directed to kill a lamb at 3 o'clock in the afternoon, on the 14th day of the first month, viz: Abib or April; This was to be continued at its appointed season every year, and thus more than fifteen hundred years passed on to the 14th day of the 1st month, A. D. 31, even at three o'clock in the afternoon, and Jesus the Lamb of God yielded up the ghost. This certainly was exact."[54]

4.1.2 The Heavenly Ministry

Bates divides the heavenly ministry of Jesus in to two phases: His work of mediation in the Holy Place and His work of judgment in the Most Holy Place. Bates division is based on his typological understanding of the Bible. Jesus work in the Most Holy Place as Judge could happen only in the typological and prophetic appointed time for the cleansing of the sanctuary. Up to this point, Jesus was ministering in the Holy Place the daily atonement for individual sins following the pattern of the Israelites feast cycle. Bates logic in this mediator work of Jesus in the Holy Place is:

> Where did he commence his daily Ministration as Mediator for all the world? Ans. - In the Holy Place. Proof - Paul, Heb. 9:12; John, Rev. 1:12, 14; Jesus, Rev. 2:1. The proof is clear that he was in the Holy Place, where the Golden Candlesticks were, sixty-five years

[52] Ibid., 81.
[53] Bates, *Typical and Anti-Typical Sanctuary*, 6-7.
[54] Ibid., 3.

> after his ascension, from A. D. 31 to 96, and that his daily ministration could not cease until the end of the appointed time, 2,300, 'Evening, Morning,' or 'daily Sacrifice.'[55]

Bates even argues that God the Father has His throne in the Holy Place not in the Most Holy Place during this mediatory ministration of Jesus Christ in heaven. He says: "The Ancient of Days, (God,) sets between the Cherubims, in the Most Holy Place. This is where he is sought unto when the National Atonement is made. Where then is His THRONE during the daily ministration? Ans. - In the type. See Exo. 29:42-44, and 30:6, 36. In the anti-type, Jesus says he sets on his Father's Throne, Rev. 3:21. John in vision sees the throne in the Holy Place where the seven lamps of fire are. See Rev. 4:1, 2 and 5; 5:1, 7. God was thereon."[56]

Bates uses the books of Hebrews and Revelation to demonstrate that Jesus' ministry in the heavenly sanctuary first took place in the Holy Place. He argues that when Paul was talking about Jesus' entrance into the heavenly sanctuary and His ministry there he only uses the word *holy places* as reference to the sanctuary itself not *holiest* as translated by the KJV in chapters 9:8 and 10:19-20. He posits that in the Hebrews' description of the sanctuary (Heb 9:1-6) the separation between the Holy and the Most Holy place was the second veil. For him it is clear that if there is a second veil there is also a first veil. He declares that the first veil was the one which Jesus entered at His ascension to heaven to become a High Priest and intercede for us. He continues saying that is impossible to go to the second veil without having passed before through the first one. He states that a careful look at the book of Hebrews shows more evidences for Jesus entrance into the sanctuary to be connected with the work of mediation than with the work of judgment. He presents a different text of Revelation–for example Rev 1:12, 14; 2:1–where Jesus is ministering in the Holy Place of the heavenly sanctuary.[57]

According to Bates, the beginning of the heavenly ministry of Jesus marks the end of all earthly sanctuary works. He posits that at that point the work of the school master of Galatians ceased because the *faith* came.[58] The real sacrifice and High Priest–Jesus–is in heaven mediating for the whole world. Following this work of mediation Bates argues that a work of judgment is necessary. On the day of atonement, the third feast must take place. He identifies the end of

[55] Ibid., 7-8.
[56] Ibid., 8.
[57] Ibid., 9-12.
[58] Ibid., 8.

2300 days prophetic period as the time when Jesus would start the cleansing of the sanctuary. He says: "Here his work ceased; Ministering and Mediating for the whole world forever; and he like his pattern in the type, entered the Most Holy Place, bearing upon his breast plate of Judgment the twelve tribes of the House of Israel."[59]

For Bates, the day of atonement is important not only in relation to the heavenly events–judgment and cleansing of the sanctuary–but also because of the events that should take place on earth. The attention of the Laodicean church should be directed to the eternal covenant of God, His commandments. This eternal covenant would allow God's people on earth to be purified and sealed. Bates argues that the sign of this covenant is the Sabbath and Sabbath observance will determine mortality or eternal life.[60] Bates posits that fidelity to all commandments of God is necessary to be sealed and prepared for events that come before the day of the Lord. In his prophetic framework, after the day of atonement is finished, Jesus leaves the sanctuary, a time of trouble begins for God's people until redemption comes, which he identifies with Jesus Himself coming to gather His people. His advice for the church is

> with such a glorious prospect now before us, let us prayerfully, earnestly, and zealously seek for its holy, and sanctifying influence to be shed all about us, so that the seal of the living God may be so indelibly stamped in our foreheads that we shall pass through the mighty conflict of the great and terrible day of the Lord, unharmed and undismayed, clear down to the day of redemption. Amen.[61]

4.2 Daily and National Atonement

Bates' views on atonement are connected with the blotting out of sin. As already stated his main focus is eschatological. He does not explain all the details about Jesus work as Mediator in the Holy Place and His judicial work in the Most Holy Place. However, he presents a clear distinction between these two works. One is the atonement for individual sins, and the other is atonement for the national sins.

4.2.1 The Daily Ministration

The daily ministration is for Bates the atonement for individual sin. When a sinner took an offering in the old sanctuary or prays, after Jesus death on the cross, his or her sin was

[59] Ibid., 9.
[60] Bates, *Seal of the Living God*, 59-69.
[61] Bates, "The Holy Sabbath," 59.

transferred from him to the sanctuary. This transference was made through the sacrificial blood. The sinner was coming in the presence of God to be cleansed of his or her sin. The daily atonement is then for him a cleansing or transferring of sin through the mediation of Christ.[62]

4.2.2 National Atonement

According to Bates, the national atonement is the day when the sanctuary is clean from all sins. This work he posits is made by Christ in the heavenly sanctuary, following the pattern of the old sanctuary. "This work of cleansing the Sanctuary is this; Jesus our Great High Priest, crowned and robed, in his royal court dress, (just like the high priest in the shadow,) rises up, and shuts to the door [Luke xiii,25,] where he had been the Mediator for all the world, and opens the door of the Most Holy Place, (or as John calls it, the Temple of God,) and there appears before God, as Daniel saw him [chap.vii,13,] with the whole Israel of God represented on his breast-plate of judgment, (like the high priest,) to plead with God, to blot out the sins of Israel."[63]

All individual sins that had been brought to the sanctuary during the year would be taken out from the sanctuary and transferred to the scape-goat–the devil–the real author of sin. "When the high priest went in before God, to plead for the forgiveness of the sins of ancient Israel, on the day of atonement, in other words, to cleanse the Sanctuary, the people did not see him until the whole work was finished, and the scape-goat had gone away with all their sins."[64]

Bates argues that the atonement for individual sins is effectuated when the whole sanctuary is clean from all sins transferred there through the blood of Christ. "Therefore, when the Sanctuary is cleansed, and the great day of atonement ended; which work will be the blotting out of all the sins of the true Israel of God; then we believe the Devil, [the scape-goat,] will be chained, or led away into a land uninhabited, bearing on him all the sins which are now being confessed by the whole Israel of God, in THEIR day of atonement."[65]

[62] Bates, *Typical and Anti-Typical Sanctuary*, 5-7.
[63] Bates, "Midnight Cry in the Past," 22.
[64] Ibid.
[65] Ibid.

4.3 Summary

Bates sees the ministry of Jesus in the heavenly sanctuary in two phases. The first phase is the Mediatory one in which Jesus, in the Holy place of the heavenly sanctuary atones for individual sins. The sins are transferred from the individual to the sanctuary. This is the individual atonement. The second phase is the Judicial phase in which Jesus analyzes the register of the individual confessed sins and transfers them to Satan, cleaning the sanctuary. This is the national atonement.

Atonement for him is not an event but a process. It begins with the coming of the sinner to God, has a transfer of sin from the sinner to the sanctuary through the blood of the sacrifice, and is finally transferred to the author of sin when the sanctuary is cleansed.

5. Summary and Conclusion

This article sets out to analyze Bates' understanding on salvation and atonement. Bates' understanding on salvation and atonement are interrelated with his prophetic interpretation. After the introductory considerations of the first section, the second section portrayed the basic framework of Bates eschatology. He follows the Millerite historical method of prophetic interpretation. After the disappointment of 1844, he focused on the feasts of the OT and specifically on the day of atonement. From his studies, he came to the conclusion that Jesus began the work of judgment at the end of the 2300 prophetic days. The cleansing of the heavenly sanctuary and the purification of God's people on earth should began after this time. The commandments of God and specifically the Sabbath should be restored before Jesus second coming. God's people should be sealed and the seal is the Sabbath. Those who will participate in the 144,000, the last generation of believers must accept the present truth–the Sabbath.

The third section discussed Bates' understanding on covenant, sin, and salvation. He believed in four everlasting covenants. All of them having as their base the ten commandments. The ten commandments are by themselves a covenant. The last generation of God's people will be in covenant with God. Those who reject this covenant will remain in sin. Sins committed willingly lead individuals to break the covenant with God and be lost. Salvation is offered

graciously by God and cannot be earned by works. Those who are in a covenantal relationship with God will have pleasure in obeying God.

The fourth section described Bates understanding on Jesus ministry as High Priest and its implications to atonement. Jesus priestly ministry in heaven has two phases. The Mediatory phase takes place in the first compartment of the sanctuary–the Holy Place–where atonement for individual sin is made. The Judicial work takes place in the second compartment of the sanctuary–the Most Holy Place–where atonement for the whole nation is made. Atonement is not an event but a process of blotting out sins.

After this consideration, it can be concluded that Bates had a strong eschatological emphases in his theology. He is not the pioneer in most of the theological understanding adopted by the Seventh-day Adventist church. However, he is one of the first to put all the peaces together in a systematic and chronologic way. He was able to link almost all Seventh-day Adventist peculiar doctrines in a chronological eschatological framework.

In spite of the fact some accused him of legalistic statement, he posited that salvation is freely offered by God to human beings, but it is a process not an event. Conversion and salvation are more than a declaration of God. It is a life period of covenantal relationship with God resulting in a new born Christian and his or her submission to the will of God.

In the same way atonement, the blotting out of individual and national sins are a process and not an event. The final annihilation of sin will be when sinners will suffer for their sins and Satan will suffer for all sins brought to the sanctuary by Jesus' mediatory work.

Bates theological assumptions are more implicit than explicit in his writings. He was not concerned in explaining how it is the process of atonement in the Holy Place or Most Holy Place. In his prophetic framework atonement and salvation are part of the whole picture and are described according to their historical significance. The prophetic timeline and everything important for proper preparation for Jesus second coming were the focus of his biblical expositions. Bates had a great passion for the Bible and anxiously was waiting for Jesus second coming.

6. Appendix I

6.1 Miller's Rule of Interpretation[66]

I. Every word must have its proper bearing on the subject presented in the Bible. *Proof*, Matt. v. 18.

II. All Scripture is necessary, and may be understood by a diligent application and study. Proof, 2 Tim.iii.15 -17.

III. Nothing revealed in Scripture can or will be hid from those who ask in faith, not wavering. *Proof*, Deut. Xxix. 29. Matt. X. John xiv. 13, 14; xv. 7. James i. 5, 6. 1 John v. 315.

IV. To understand doctrine, bring all the Scriptures together on the subject you wish to know; then let every word have its proper influence; and if you can form your theory without a contradiction, you cannot be in error. *Proof*, Isa. xxviii. 729; xxxv. 8. Prov. xix. 27. Luke xxiv. 27, 44, 45. Rom. Xvi. 26. James v. 19. 2 Pet. i.19, 20.

V. Scripture must be its own expositor, since it is a rule of itself. If I depend on a teacher to expound to me, and he should guess at its meaning, or desire to have it so on account of his sectarian creed, or to be thought wise, then his guessing, desire, creed or wisdom, is my rule, and not the Bible. *Proof*, Ps. xix. 7–11; cxix. 97–105. Mat. xxiii. 8–10. 1 Cor. ii. 12–16. Ezk. xxxiv. 18, 19. Luke xi. 52. Matt. ii. 7,8.

VI. God has revealed things to came, by visions, in figures and parables; and in this way the same things are oftentimes revealed again and again, by different visions, or in different figures and parables. If you whish to understand them you must combine them all in one. *Proof*, Ps. lxxxix. 19. Hos. xii. 10. Hab. ii. 2. Acts ii. 17. I Cor. x. 6. Matt. xii. 13, 34. Gen. xli. 1–32. Heb. ix. 9, 24. Ps. lxxviii. 2. Dan. ii, vii and viii. Acts x. 9–16.

VII. Visions are always mentions as such. II Cor. xii. 1.

VIII. Figures always have a figurative meaning, and are used much in prophecy to represent future things, times and events, such as mountains, meaning governments, Dan. ii. 35,

[66] Quoted from Maxwell and Damsteegt, *Source Book for the Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology*, 18-19.

44; beasts, meaning kingdoms, Dan. vii. 8, 17; waters, meaning people, Rev. xvii. 1,15; day, meaning year, etc. , Ezk. iv. 6.

IX. Parables are used as comparisons to illustrate subjects, and must be explained in the same "way as figures, by the subject and Bible. Mark iv. 13.

X. Figures sometimes have two or more different significations, as day is used in a figurative sense to represent three different periods of time, namely, first, indefinite, Eccles. vii.14; second, definite, a day for a year, Ezk. iv. 6, and third a day for a thousand years, 2 Pet. iii. 8. The right construction will harmonize with the Bible, and make good sense; other constructions will not.

XI. If a word makes good sense as it stands, and docs no violence to the simple laws of nature, it is to be understood literally; if not, figuratively. Key. Xii. 1, 2; xvii. 37.

XII. To learn the meaning of a figure, trace the word through your Bible, and when you find it explained, substitute the explanation for the word used; and, if it make good sense, you need not look further; if not, look again.

XIII. To know whether we have the true historical event for the fulfillment of a prophecy; If you find every word of the prophecy (after the figures are understood) is literally fulfilled, then you may know that your history is the true event; but if one word lacks a fulfillment, then you must look for another event, or wait its future development; for takes care that history and prophecy shall agree, so that the true believing children of God may never be ashamed. Ps. xxil 5. Isa. xlv. 17–19. 1 Pet. ii. 6. Rev. xvii. 17. Acts iii. 18.

XIV. The most important rule of all is, that you must have faith. It must be a faith that requires a sacrifice, and if tried, would give up the dearest object on earth, the world and all its desires, character, living, occupation, friends, home, comforts and worldly honors. If any of these should hinder our believing any part of God's word, it would show our faith to be vain. Nor can we ever believe so long as one of these motives lies lurking our hearts. We must believe that God will never forfeit his word; and we can have confidence that he who takes notice of the sparrow's fall, and numbers the hairs of our head, will guard the translation of his own word, and through a barrier around it, and prevent those who sincerely trust in God, and put implicitly confidence in his word, from erring far from the truth.

7. Bibliography

Anderson, Godfrey Tryggve. *Outrider of the Apocalypse: Life and Times of Joseph Bates*. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1972.

Barnes, Albert. *Book of Revelation: With a Prefatory Essay on the Year-Day Principle*. [Illustrated annotated edition] London: Blackie, 1832.

Bates, Joseph. *The Opening Heavens or, a Connected View of the Testimony of the Prophets and Apostles, Concerning the Opening Heavens, Compared with Astronomical Observations, and of the Present and Future Location of the New Jerusalem, the Paradise of God*. New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1846.

_____. *Second Advent Way Marks and High Heaps : Or a Connected View of the Fulfilment of Prophecy, by God's Peculiar People, from the Year 1840-1847*. New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1847.

_____. *A Vindication of the Seventh-Day Sabbath and the Commandments of God : With a Further History of God's Peculiar People from 1847-1848*. New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1848.

_____. *A Seal of the Living God. A Hundred Forty-Four Thousand, of the Servants of God Being Sealed, in 1849*. New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1849.

_____. *An Explanation of the Typical and Anti-Typical Sanctuary by the Scriptures, with a Chart*. New Bedford: Press of Benjamin Lindsey, 1850.

_____. "Midnight Cry in the Past." *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, December 1850, 21-24.

_____. "New Testament Testimony." *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, November 1850, 10-13.

_____. "Duty to Our Children." *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, January 1851, 39-40.

_____. "The Holy Sabbath." *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, April 7 1851, 57-59.

_____. "New Testament Seventh Day Sabbath." *Advent Review and Sabbath Herald*, January 1851, 31-33.

_____. *The Autobiography of Elder Joseph Bates: Embracing a Long Life on Shipboard, with Sketches of Voyages on the Atlantic and Pacific Oceans, the Baltic and Mediterranean Seas, Also Impressment and Service on Board British War Ships, Long Confinement in Dartmoor Prison, Early Experience in Reformatory Movements; Travels in Various Parts of the World and a Brief*

Account of the Great Advent Movement of 1840-44. Battle Creek: Steam Press of the Seventh-day Adventist Publishing Association, 1868.

Bates, Joseph, and Clarence Creager Crisler. *Life of Joseph Bates: An Autobiography*. Takoma Park, Washington, DC: Review and Herald Pub. Association, 1927.

Bates, Joseph, and James White. *Early Life and Later Experience and Labors of Elder Joseph Bates*. Battle Creek, MI: Press of the Seventh-day adventist publishing association, 1877.

Boundey, George Burton. "Spiritual Lineage from James White and Joseph Bates to George Boundey." Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1977.

Bovee, Mark L. "Pioneers in the History of This Denomination." Term Paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary,

Damsteegt, P. Gerard. *Foundations of the Seventh-Day Adventist Message and Mission*. Berrien Springs, MI: Andrews University Press, 1988.

_____. *How Our Pioneers Discovered the Sanctuary Doctrine*. Fall 1992. Accessed 26 March 2004. Article On-line. Available from http://www2.andrews.edu/~damsteeg/pion.html.

_____. *Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology an Outline*. Berrien Springs, MI: Christian Heritage Media, 1995.

Dick, Everett Newfon. *Founders of the Message*. Takoma Park, Washington DC: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 1938.

Engen, Sadie Owen, and James Converse. *God Set the Sails*. Mountain View, CA: Pacific Press Publishing Association, 1982.

Froom, Le Roy Edwin. *The Prophetic Faith of Our Fathers ; the Historical Development of Prophetic Interpretation*. 4 vols. Washington, D.C.: Review and Herald, 1946-1954.

Gordon, Paul A. *Pioneer Articles: On the Sanctuary, Daniel 8:14, the Judgment, 2300 Days, Year-Day Principle, Atonement, 1846-1905*. Washington, D.C.: Ellen G. White Estate, 1983.

Henderson, Timothy Edwin. "Joseph Bates, Health Reformer." Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1977.

"Historical Notes from the Land of Joseph Bates -- New Bedford and Fairhaven Massachusetts. James White Library.

Joiner, James. *These Were the Courageous*. Nashville: Southern Pub. Association, 1968.

Judd, Wayne. "Father Bates's Story." *Adventist Heritage*, Summer 1975, 63-64.

Knight, George R. *Joseph Bates: The Real Founder of Seventh-Day Adventism*. Hagerstown, MD: Review and Herald Publishing Association, 2004.

Leppanen, Veikko Olavi. "Itineraries of Joseph Bates in 1849-56." Photographic reproduction of typescript copy, Andrews University Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1975.

Maxwell, C. Mervyn. "Joseph Bates and Seventh-Day Adventist Sabbath Theology." Typescript copy, 1977.

Maxwell, C. Mervyn, and P. Gerard Damsteegt. *Source Book for the Development of Seventh-Day Adventist Theology*. Rev. ed., 1989.

McGaughey, Ken. *Seventh-Day Adventist Roots*. 1998. Accessed April 1 2004. On line Magazine. Available from http://www.steps2life.org/php/view_article.php?article_id=1079.

Riley, Kenneth Randolph. "An Investigation into Whether Joseph Bates, E. G. White or F. M. Wilcox Taught Sabbath Observance as a Means of Salvation." Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1966.

Robinson, Virgil E. *Cabin Boy to Advent Crusader*. Nashville: Southern Publishing Association, 1960.

Shea, William H. "The Year-Day Principle: The Reckoning of Time in Apocalyptic Prophecy, 1981." Typescript.

Stenberg, Clarence Edwin. "A Study of the Influence of Joseph Bates on the Denomination of Seventh-Day Adventists." Thesis, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1950.

Thomas, N. Gordon. "Joseph Bates - Adventist Pilgrim Father." *Adventist Review*, 26 November 1987, 11-12.

Wadworth, Kenneth. "Joseph Bates." Term paper, Andrews University, Seventh-day Adventist Theological Seminary, 1971.

Wilcox, Carl R. "The Travels of Joseph Bates." Term paper, Andrews University, Undergraduate Colleges, 1964.