

Globethics Repository

The logo for Globethics, featuring the word "Globethics" in white, sans-serif font centered within a solid blue rectangular background.

Ulama Fatwa and Voting Behaviour

This page was generated automatically upon download from the Globethics Repository. More information on Globethics see <https://www.globethics.net>. Data and content policy of Globethics Repository see <https://repository.globethics.net/pages/policy>.

Item Type	Thesis
Authors	Sirojuddin, Mohammad
Publisher	International Islamic University of Malaysia
Rights	With permission of the license/copyright holder
Download date	2026-06-22 05:22:42
Link to Item	http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.12424/223604



'ULAMĀ FATWĀ AND VOTING BEHAVIOUR:
A STUDY OF NAHDLATUL ULAMA FEMALE MEMBERS'
POLITICAL PARTICIPATION IN THE 2008 GRESIK
ELECTION, EAST JAVA, INDONESIA

BY

MOHAMMAD SIROJUDDIN

A dissertation submitted in fulfilment of the requirement for the
degree of Master of Human Sciences (Political Science)

Kuliyah of Islamic Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences
International Islamic University Malaysia

AUGUST 2013

ABSTRACT

The existence of '*ulamā*'/*kyai* in Indonesian Islamic tradition is very significant. They are recognized as experts on the understanding of the Qur'an; Sunna of Prophet Muhammad SAW; and the classical works of Muslim scholars. By doing so, *kyai*/*ulamā* as Islamic leaders have the capacity to influence their followers by issuing *fatwā*. This study attempts to analyze the voting behaviour of NU female members in 2008 Gresik election in electing the governor of East Java. It examines the NU female members' perspective on the involvement of *kyai*/*ulamā*' in political practices and *kyai fatwā* on politics. Those issues were investigated using qualitative method of analysis which relied on descriptive analytical approach and interpretation. Data was collected through interviews with the head of Gresik Muslimat Organization Branch and several heads of NU female members in five districts of Gresik. The data was also collected through the use of a questionnaire from 250 purposively sampled NU female members selected from five of the eighteen districts. The result of the study suggests strongly that the NU female members in 2008 Gresik election was not affected by *fatwā* issued by '*ulamā*'/*kyai*. It indicates NU female members' rational behaviour and personal maturity in determining their political choices.

خلاصة البحث

إن للعلماء ويطلق عليهم باللغة الإندونيسية كِيَاهِي نفوذًا مهمًا في حياة الشعب الإندونيسي، حيث اعتُبر العلماء بأهمّ الراسخون في فهم معاني القرآن الكريم والسنة النبوية الشريفة، فضلاً عن استيعابهم للتراث الإسلامي. وبهذه المكانة المرموقة في المجتمع لا شك أن تكون لديهم قوة التأثير، خاصة حينما يصدر عن الفتاوى الدينيّة. وهذه الدراسة محاولة لتسليط الضوء على السلوك الانتخابي في عام ٢٠٠٨ لدى عضوات جمعية نهضة العلماء في محافظة غرسيك (Gresik) أثناء انتخاب حاكم ولاية جاوة الشرقية، فالدراسة تحلل مدى تأثير عضوات جمعية النهضة في الممارسات السياسية بفتاوى العلماء في القضايا السياسية. وفي دراسة هذه الظاهرة استخدم الباحث منهج التحليل النوعي الذي اعتمد على المنهج الوصفي التحليلي والتفسيري. وللإثراء العلمي فقد تمّ جمع البيانات الأساسية بإجراء المقابلات الشخصية مع رئيسة منظمة المسلمات التابعة لجمعية نهضة العلماء فرع غرسيك، بالإضافة إلى مقابلة رئيسات منظمة المسلمات في خمس مقاطعات بالمحافظة نفسها. فضلاً عن ذلك فقد تمّ كذلك جمع البيانات من خلال توزيع الاستبيانات على ٢٥٠ عينة لعضوات جمعية نهضة العلماء من ثماني عشرة مقاطعة. وقد استنتجت الدراسة أن فتاوى العلماء لا تؤثر في توجيه موقف عضوات جمعية نهضة العلماء في محافظة غرسيك في سلوكهن الانتخابي في انتخاب حاكم ولاية جاوة الشرقية في عام ٢٠٠٨، كما أنه تبين أن لعضوات جمعية العلماء في المنطقة اعتباراتهن العقلية ونضجهن الشخصي في تحديد خياراتهن السياسية.

APPROVAL PAGE

I certify that I have supervised and read this study and that in my opinion, it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a dissertation for the degree of Master of Human Sciences (Political Science).

.....
Muhamad Fuzi bin Omar
Supervisor

I certify that I have read this study and that in my opinion it conforms to acceptable standards of scholarly presentation and is fully adequate, in scope and quality, as a dissertation for the degree of Master of Human Sciences (Political Science).

.....
Abdul Rashid Moten
Examiner

This dissertation was submitted to the Department of Political Sciences and is accepted as a partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Human Sciences (Political Science).

.....
Tunku Mohar bin Tunku Mohd. Mokhtar
Head, Department of Political Science

This dissertation was submitted to the Kulliyah of Revealed Knowledge and Human Sciences and is accepted as a partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Human Sciences (Political Science).

.....
Ibrahim Mohamed Zein
Dean, Kulliyah of Islamic Revealed
Knowledge and Human Sciences

DECLARATION

I hereby declare that this dissertation is the result of my own investigations, except where otherwise stated. I also declare that it has not been previously or concurrently submitted as a whole for any other degrees at IIUM or other institutions.

Mohammad Sirojuddin

Signature

Date

INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY MALAYSIA

**DECLARATION OF COPYRIGHT AND AFFIRMATION
OF FAIR USE OF UNPUBLISHED RESEARCH**

Copyright © 2013 by Mohammad Sirojuddin. All rights reserved.

***'ULAMĀ FATWĀ* AND VOTING BEHAVIOUR: A STUDY OF
NAHDLATUL ULAMA FEMALE MEMBERS' POLITICAL
PARTICIPATION IN THE 2008 GRESIK ELECTION, EAST JAVA,
INDONESIA**

No part of this unpublished research may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise without the permission of the copyright holder except as provided below.

1. Any material contained in or derived from this unpublished research may only be used by others in their writing with due acknowledgement.
2. IIUM or its library will have the right to make and transmit copies (print or electronic) for institutional and academic purpose.
3. The IIUM library will have the right to make, store in a retrieval system and supply copies of this unpublished research if requested by other universities and research libraries.

Affirmed by Mohammad Sirojuddin

.....
Signature

.....
Date

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Alhamdulillah. Praise be to *Allah Subhānahu Wata'ālā* who has given me the guidance and blessing that make it possible for me to complete this dissertation. *Ṣalawāt and salām* peace be upon Prophet Muhammad SAW, his family and companions. I am grateful to my supervisor, Dr. Muhamad Fuzi bin Omar for his invaluable guidance and insightful ideas. He provided me with constant encouragement and advice throughout the completion of this dissertation. It will not have finished without his supervision. My gratitude also goes to Associate Prof. Dr. Ishtiaq Hussain who reviewed the earlier draft of my research proposal. Special thanks to all the lecturers in the Department of Political Science who have taught me, especially Prof. Dr. Abdul Rashid Moten, Prof. Dr. El-Fatih Abdullahi Abdel Salam, Associate Prof. Dr. Garoot S. Eissa, Associate Prof. Dr. Wahabuddin Rais, Associate Prof. Dr. Md. Moniruzzaman, Dr. Danial Mohd Yusof, Dr. AdillaIshaq, and also the Head of the department of Political Science, Dr. Tunku Mohar bin Tunku Mohamad Mokhtar. Special thanks go to my parents K.H. Muhammad Sabiq Abdullah and Nyai Hj. Sa'adah. I believe they would be the happiest parents to know that I have been able to complete my Masters. I would like to thank my patient wife, Siti Aminah, for inspiring and giving me confidence to pursue my dreams during my studies in Malaysia. My deepest gratitude goes to my beloved son and daughter, Fareed Nahdan Rabbani and Fazat Mazaya Rahmah who always enlighten me with sincere love and affection from which I gained reasons to maintain my strength and courage to finish my study. I am also deeply indebted to Umar Wahyudi who helped me in collecting data during my field research. I also thank all my friends who always supported and encouraged me during the process of writing this dissertation, especially Abdul Qoyyum who taught me to read questionnaire data and Fiqih Risalah M. A. who has inspired me to complete this level of studies. Finally, I would like to thank everybody who was important to the successful realization of this dissertation. I would like to express my apologies that I could not mention their names one by one.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract.....	ii
Abstract in Arabic.....	iii
Approval Page.....	iv
Declaration Page.....	v
Copyright Page.....	vi
Acknowledgements.....	vii
List of Tables.....	x
List of Abbreviations.....	xi
CHAPTER 1: FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY.....	1
Introduction.....	1
Statement of the Problem.....	4
Justification of Study.....	5
Objectives of the Study.....	6
Literature Review.....	6
Theoretical Framework.....	11
Definition of Key Concepts.....	17
Research Methodology.....	19
Population.....	19
Data Source.....	20
Data Collection Strategies.....	20
Data Analysis.....	21
Outline of Chapters.....	22
CHAPTER 2: THE NATURE OF <i>FATWĀ</i> AND THE INFLUENCE OF ‘<i>ULAMĀ FATWĀ</i> ON THE SOCIETY IN INDONESIA.....	23
Introduction.....	23
Nahdlatul Ulama Organization.....	24
<i>Fatwā and Baḥtsu al-Masāil in Nahdlatul Ulama</i>	29
<i>Fatwā</i> Issuing Procedures in Nahdlatul Ulama.....	33
NU <i>Fatwā</i> on the Position of Women in Islam.....	37
NU <i>Fatwā</i> on Gender Equality.....	39
NU <i>Fatwā</i> on Women Becoming Members of Parliament.....	40
NU <i>Fatwā</i> on Women Becoming a Head of village.....	42
NU <i>Fatwā</i> on Women Becoming a President.....	45
NU <i>Kyai Fatwā</i> in 2008 East Java Governor Election.....	52
The Nature of the Influence of NU <i>Kyai Fatwā</i>	55
Charismatic Leadership.....	55
Economic Status.....	56
Political Patron.....	57
The Change of <i>Kyai</i> Leadership Pattern.....	58
Conclusion.....	60

CHAPTER 3: GRESIK: BACKGROUND AND NU FEMALE MEMBERS' POLITICAL PARTICIPATIONS	62
Introduction	62
Geographic Condition	63
Demographic Condition	64
Demographic Research Area	66
Demographic Characteristics of Respondents	68
NU Female Members' Voting Behaviour	71
Factors Affecting NU Female Members Attitude towards ' <i>Ulamā</i>	76
Implication of <i>Kyai's Fatwā</i> on NU Female Members' Voting Behaviour : An Analysis	81
The Involvement of <i>kyai</i> in Political Practices	82
<i>Kyai Fatwā</i> on Female Political Participation	85
Conclusion	93
 CHAPTER 4: CONCLUSION	 95
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	 98
 APPENDIX A : Questionnaire	 104
APPENDIX B : NU <i>Fatwā</i> on the Position of Women in Islam	109
APPENDIX C : NU <i>Fatwā</i> on Gender Equality	114
APPENDIX D : NU <i>Fatwā</i> on Women Becoming Members of Parliament	119
APPENDIX E : NU <i>Fatwā</i> on Women Becoming a Head of Villages	120
APPENDIX F : The Provision of Legislative Council Central Board of NU on President	123
APPENDIX G : Electoral Division Map of 2009 Legislative Election in Gresik District	126
APPENDIX H : The 2 nd Round Voting Result of 2008 Governor Election of East Java Province in Gresik District	127
APPENDIX I : The Voting Result of 2009 Presidential General Election in Gresik District	128
APPENDIX J : The Valid Votes of the Parties and Parliamentary Seats of Gresik District in 2009 General Election	129

LIST OF TABLES

<u>Table No.</u>		<u>Page No.</u>
1.1	Framework of Analysis	17
3.1	Number of Inhabitants in Each Sub District	65
3.2	Age Group of the Respondents	68
3.3	The Level of Respondents' Education	69
3.4	Respondents' Occupation	70
3.5	Respondents' Monthly Income	71
3.6	The People who Studied at <i>Pondok Pesantren</i>	72
3.7	Types of <i>Pesantren</i>	73
3.8	Party Affiliations	74
3.9	Candidates for Governor of East Java Province	75
3.10	Presidential Candidates	75
3.11	Comparison Between Gubernatorial and Presidential Candidates	76
3.12	The Involvement of <i>Kyai/Ulamā</i> in Political Practices	78
3.13	<i>Kyai fatwā</i> on Female Political Participation	80

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

<i>Bahtsu al masāil</i>	Research or discussion of religious issues performed by NU Organization.
<i>Dharma Wanita</i>	Women's duty.
DPR	<i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat</i> , People Representatives Council (Indonesian Parliament).
DPRD	<i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah</i> , Regional People Representatives.
<i>Fatwā</i>	Religious edict.
KB	<i>Keluarga Berencana</i> , Family Planning.
K.H	<i>Kyai Haji</i> .
<i>Kitab Kuning</i>	Yellow Book, a classical book as guidance for solving actual problems in NU circle.
<i>Kyai</i>	Islamic Teacher, often with great charisma, the leader of <i>Pesantren</i> .
KPU	<i>Komisi Pemilihan Umum</i> , General Election Commission.
MUI	<i>Majelis Ulama Indonesia</i> , Indonesian <i>Ulama</i> Council.
Muhammadiyah	Indonesia's largest Islamic modernist organization.
NU	The Largest traditionalist Islamic organization in Indonesia.
New Order	The era of the Suharto regime, in contrast to Sukarno's Old Order.
<i>Pesantren</i>	Islamic Boarding School.
PAN	<i>Partai Amanat Nasional</i> , National Mandate Party.
PPP	<i>Partai Persatuan Pembangunan</i> , United Development Party.
PKB	<i>Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa</i> , National Awakening Party.
PKS	<i>Partai Keadilan Sejahtera</i> , Prosperous Justice Party.
PDI-P	<i>Partai Demokrasi Indonesia-Perjuangan</i> , Indonesian Democratic Party-Struggle.
RMI	<i>Rabi'ah al Ma'āhid al-Islāmiyyah</i> , Islamic Boarding School Bond.
<i>Posyandu</i>	<i>Pos Pelayanan Terpadu</i> , a center for pre- and post-natal health care and information for women and for children under five years old.
<i>Santri</i>	A student of <i>Pesantren</i> .
<i>Ummah</i>	Islamic Community.
<i>Yayasan</i>	Foundation.

CHAPTER 1

FRAMEWORK OF THE STUDY

BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

In a country like Indonesia that follows a patriarchal value system, the chances for women to become politicians are limited due to society's perceptions regarding the division of roles between men and women tend to be biased towards thinking that a woman's role should be limited to managing the household. Prejudices shaped by local culture and Islamic teachings intersect, causing a lot of men and women to believe in a woman's mental and physical weakness as a matter of nature (*kodrat*). Some Islamic texts read in *the pesantren* illustrate the ability of women as less rational than men. These ideas originated from a time when access to knowledge was a man's privilege and women were confined to the domestic sphere.¹

Members of the Muslim women's organizations connected to the NU often pressed their male counterparts for *fatwā* concerning women's positions in public life. In 1957 the NU issued a *fatwā* that allowed women to become members of legislative bodies, while in 1961 it disallowed women to hold the position head of village.

Starting in 1998, after the demise of Soeharto, NU circles held the most open debates and seminars with male and female speakers who addressed the topic of a female president. For NU women² this was a natural extension of the steadily developing debate concerning women's status within the NU that has been taking place since the early 1990s.

¹ Fatima Mernissi, *Women's Rebellion & Islamic Memory*. (London and New Jersey: Zed Books, 1996), 118.

² NU women here refers to the *Muslimāt*. It is an autonomous organization within NU, which consists women only as its members.

A watershed event for NU women before that was the 1997 NU conference in Lombok concerning women's political leadership. After extensive discussions, the council of NU *'ulamā* (religious leaders) decided that women could hold positions in the public sphere, provided they are capable or have the right qualifications for holding these positions. Basically, this meant that in the national arena, no limits were placed on what women can do, including becoming the president.³ Not all the NU religious scholars agreed on this point, however, and some later interpreted this decision to allow a woman to go as high as the vice-presidency only.⁴ This was based on the reasoning that a woman could never hold the highest state authority.

During the presidential election in July 2004, a *fatwā* regarding the prohibition of women in leadership regained public concern in Indonesian political discourse. It was issued by a number of charismatic *kyai* who were affiliated with the Nahdlatul Ulama (NU) Organization.⁵ This was seen by many as a covert attack on Megawati and PDI-P that would benefit her political rivals, many of whom were from Muslim Parties.⁶ This controversy was also heightened by a number of other NU *kyai* who were engaged in the Medina Declaration who issued a *fatwā* concerning the same issue.

³ Andree Feillard, "Potensi Perubahan Relasi Gender di Lingkungan Umat Islam: Sebuah Proyeksi dan Pemaparan Data". In *Menakar "Harga"Perempuan*. (Bandung: Penerbit Mizan, 1999). 225

⁴ Robin Bush, L. "Wacana Perempuan di Lingkungan NU". In *Tashwirul Afkar*, no.5, 1999.

⁵ Generally, *'ulamā* and *kyai* have different meanings, however in this study, the researcher considers *'ulamā* and *Kyai* as essentially the same. *'Ulamā*, especially refers to as *kyai*, possesses a great deal of Islamic knowledge or is an intellectual authoritative in the Islamic field. On the other hand, *kyai* usually refers to a more general category of a leader and teacher of Islamic religion. *Kyai* also a leader of a *pesantren* (religious school). Therefore, the predicate *kyai* always relates to such degree that emphasizes the recognition of glory voluntarily given to leader of a community as a sign of respect and not an academic degree which is acquired through formal education. See Ziemek Manfred *Pesantren dalam perubahan Sosial*, (Jakarta: P3M, 1986), 131.

⁶ D. Bouchier., "Habibi's Interregnum: Reformasi, Election, Regionalism and the Struggle for Power." In *Indonesia in Transition: Social Aspect of Reformasi and Crisis*, edited by C. Manning and P. van Dierman, (Singapore: ISEAS, 2000), 20.

The *fatwā*, issued by the NU *kyai*, belonged to the Medina Declaration after meeting with Syaikh Muḥammad ibn ‘Alawī ibn ‘Abbās al-Malikī al-Ḥasanī.⁷ Among those who involved were K.H. Masduqi Mahfouz, K.H. Ahmad Idris Marzuki (Lirboyo Islamic Boarding School Kediri), K.H. Zainuddin Jazuli (al-Falah Islamic Boarding School, Ploso, Kediri), K.H. Agoes Ali Masyhuri (Tulangan, Sidoarjo) K.H. Nuruddin A.Rahman (Bangkalan), K.H. Hisham Syafaat (Blokagung, Banyuwangi), K.H. Nurul Huda Jazuli (*Pesantren* Ploso, Kediri), K.H. Ahmad Subadar (Islamic Boarding School Besuk, Pasuruan). They issued a *fatwā* called the Medina Declaration, inspired by Syaikh Muḥammad who pronounced that Indonesia is not within the *khilāfah* system. This means that Indonesia is a country following a presidential system, so that women are eligible to participate in political practice in general and to some extent run for candidacy in elections.

The *fatwā* prohibiting women to run in a leaders contest also appeared in 2008, when Khofifah Indarparawansa was nominated as Governor of the East Java province. *Fatwā of ḥarām* or strong prohibition was signed and gazetted by a number of NU *kyai* (based on the *pesantren*) on August 20, 2008, at Asrama Haji Sukolilo Surabaya, later known as the meeting of *Sukolilo Caucus*. Among them were K.H. Zainuddin Jazuli (al-Falah Islamic Boarding School, Ploso, Kediri), K.H. Idris Ahmad Marzuki (Lirboyo Islamic Boarding School, Kediri), K.H. Nawawi Abdul Jalil (*Pesantren* Sidogiri, Pasuruan), K.H. Abdul Hamid (*Pesantren* Batabata, Pemekasan), K.H. Kholil As'ad (*Pesantren* Saletreng, Situbondo), K.H.

⁷ He is a charismatic scholar and hadith expert from Sulṭāniyyah District in the Arabian Peninsula. He gained a doctorate in hadith studies from the University of Al-Azhar Egypt at the age of 25. Syaikh Muḥammad's father, Syaikh Alawi was the teacher of K.H. Maemun Zubair and K.H. Abdullah Faqih (Islamic Boarding School Langitan, Tuban), while his grandfather, Sheikh Abbas Al-Maliki, was the teacher of K.H. Hashim Ash'ari, the founder of NU, the largest Islamic community organization in Indonesia.

Ahmad Subadar (*Pesantren* Besuk, Pasuruan), K.H. Abdul Aziz Mansur (*Pesantren* Pacul Gowang, Jombang), K.H. Nurul Huda Jazuli (*Pesantren* Ploso, Kediri), and K.H. Nawawi Musiri.

It is worth mentioning that based on the names presented above, there were some figures who contradicted two *fatwā* and this reflected the inconsistency of their political attitude. Such K.H. Zainuddin Jazuli (Al-Falah Islamic Boarding School, Ploso, Kediri), K.H. Idris Ahmad Marzuki (Lirboyo Islamic Boarding School, Kediri), K.H. Nurul Huda Jazuli (Ploso Islamic Boarding School, Kediri), and K.H. Ahmad Subadar (Besuk Islamic Boarding School, Pasuruan), in the 2004 presidential elections, did not agree with the *fatwā of ḥarām* and were willing to support and allow women leaders, as accorded by Medina Declaration. On the other hand, in 2008, they supported the *fatwā harām* or rejection of female leadership by signing the *Sukolilo Caucus*. As a matter of fact, the presence of such *fatwā* had an implication on the voting behaviour of the Muslimat as to whether or not they could participate in political practice, in this case a governorship election. Therefore, this very phenomenon needs to be studied in an academic manner since such *fatwā* rejecting female leaders could have affected voting behaviour.

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

This study tries to identify the influence of ‘*ulamā* on people’s voting behaviour with specific reference to the impact of NU *kyai fatwā* on Muslimat’s voting behaviour. The study will answer the following questions:

1. What is the nature of *fatwā* issued by NU *kyai vis-à-vis* the NU women members?

2. What is the nature of the influence of NU *kyai*'s *fatwā* on NU women political participation?
3. What are the implications of *fatwā ḥarām* pertaining to the voting behaviour of NU Muslimat in Gresik, East Java, Indonesia?

JUSTIFICATION OF THE STUDY

In Indonesia, especially in East Java province, *kyai* or religious authority can not be separated from public life. In fact, *kyai* has become the center of all activities of society, including political activity. Possessing religious authority, *kyai* have incredible charisma in the public eyes. The charisma has given birth to a close relationship between the *kyai* and society like the relationship between father and child, teacher and pupil. In fact, a charismatic *kyai* is believed by the community as someone who knows their secret and is ready to embody the characteristics of God. Here, *kyai* does not only bear the mandate as an educator in the community in teaching religious sciences, but all his actions, including political opinions, serve as an example or role model for society.

Departing from this description, all the attitudes and thoughts of *kyai* are always present, causing special attraction academic analysis. *First*, as an example and model for communities, all of *kyai*'s actions determine the patterns of socio-political order in the society. *Second*, there are enough studies about *kyai* conducted by researchers, but none that specifically examines the political attitudes of NU *kyai*, especially with regard to inconsistencies on the *fatwā* that influence the member of the communities.

OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

This present study has two primary objectives. Firstly, it aims at understanding the implication of 'ulamā' *fatwā* in its relation to political issues. As a matter of fact, the presence of *fatwa*(s) in a Muslim majority community like in Gresik often has an impact, if not a consideration, for that community's life; and political attitudes in this regard. *Fatwā* issued by NU's *kyai* on women participation in political practice in 2008, for instance, lead into a polemic for female members of NU organization, whether or not they ought to follow the *fatwā* when the election came as one of the candidates was their female leader. This voting behaviour needs to be studied and it becomes the chief objective in order to know whether such voting behaviour has to do with external factors such as *fatwā* 'ulamā' or whether internal factors occurred.

LITERATURE REVIEW

A number of books and articles on this subject matter have been published by Indonesian and Western scholars. One of the books, especially on the Javanese *kyai* was carried out by Clifford Geertz⁸ in the 1960s. The study attracted the attention of scholars, both Indonesian and Western, who were interested in the development of Islam in Indonesia. This study is significant because he has laid the framework for understanding the political influence of the *kyai* in Java. Geertz's study also explains the political problems of Indonesia in general. Nevertheless, his study has been criticized by some scholars, such as Mark Woodward⁹ who argues that Geertz has failed to understand the development of Islam in Java. However, despite this

⁸ Mark R Clifford Geertz, *The Religion of Java*, Glencoe, (Illinois: Free Press, 1960).

⁹ Woodward, *Islam in Java: Normative Piety and Mysticism in the Sultanate of Yogyakarta*, (Tucson: The University of Arizona Press, 1989).

criticism, Geertz has pioneered studies on modern Javanese Islam; other studies on Islam in Java always refer to the work by Geertz.

In many respect, subsequent studies on this theme differ from the approaches used by Geertz. Hiroko Horikoshi¹⁰ did a research on the role of the *kyai* in West Java in maintaining social order, whereas Zamakhsari Dhofier¹¹ focused his study on *kyai* in the *pesantren*, or what he calls the *pesantren tradition*. Dhofier based his study on the pattern of relationships between *kyai* and *santri* (students) and traditional Islam. He also discusses the relationship between the *kyai* network in a wider geographic area and their attachment to the close family ties. Another study was conducted by Arifin Mansurnoor.¹² He analyzed the successive Madurese *kyai* and scholars as agents of change, as the elite of religious scholars, and the role of *kyai* in creating the *pesantren* and Muslim tradition. There are patterns of cultural cooperation between scholars in Sunda Java and Madura. Scholars in these areas are the elites who have a strong influence in establishing religious communities. Transmission patterns are institutionalized through *pesantren* education. Cottages or *madrasah* in these areas are major educational institutions and are regarded by researchers as the primary means of socialization. Informal institutions of religious instruction are the main tools used in transmitting values and norms, and religious symbols to the community.

The comprehensive role of *kyai* is apparently waning in contemporary Javanese society. The result of the research conducted by Mansurnoor has shown that the changes in the role of the *kyai* in general have led to a change of their

¹⁰ Hiroko Horikoshi, *A Traditional Leader in a Time of Change: The Kijaji and Ulama in West Java*. Microfilm of typescript, (Ann Arbor, Mich.: Xerox University Microfilms, 1976).

¹¹ Zamakhsyari Dhofier, *Tradisi Pesantren: Studi Tentang Pandangan Hidup Kyai*, (Jakarta: LP3ES, 1985).

¹² Mansurnoor Lik Arifin, *Islam in an Indonesian World: Ulama of Madura*, (Yogyakarta: Gadjah Mada University Press, 1990).

position in the wider society. Some religious leaders are now less influential than other functionaries such as a village leader: People no longer seek the advice of the *kyai* in temporal or worldly matters as they used to do before. The changes in '*ulamā*'s positions may be caused by modernization that has led to the threatening of traditional values and loss of its meaning. In addition, changes are also due to the fact that many *kyai* are no longer able to meet all the needs of the community due to their limited secular knowledge; most of them only have religious knowledge. Nevertheless, there are many unanswered questions, because Mansurnoor only focused on their concern on the role of religious leaders in relation to other functionaries in the development projects that were undertaken in the villages. Mansurnoor's study did not consider how the *kyai* used their power in the Javanese community at large.

Meanwhile, Endang Turmudzi¹³ tried to complete the study conducted by Mansurnoor by focusing his concern on the role of the *kyai* in politics. After NU issued the policy at the NU *khittah* in 1926, the *kyai* preferred not to engage directly in practical politics. However, along with the socio-political changes in Indonesia during the Reformation era, several NU *kyai* had enthusiastically engaged in practical politics. In addition, the author argues that the *kyai* sit at an honoured position and have the authority in religion; that is why they are able to influence and move the emotions of their followers.

Another study has been carried out by Ali Maschan Moesa.¹⁴ In his book *Nationalism Kyai: Konstruksi Sosial Berbasis Agama*, he describes his findings on *kyai* nationalism constructed on the basis of sentiment rather than faith. It is built upon the values of plurality (*al-umma*), a sense of brotherhood (*al-*

¹³ Endang Turmudzi, *Perselingkuhan Kyai dan Kekuasaan*, (Yogyakarta: LKIS, 2006).

¹⁴ Ali Maschan Moesa, *Nasionalisme Kyai: Konstruksi Sosial Berbasis Agama*, (Yogyakarta: LKIS, 2007).

qaumiyah), solidarity in diversity (*ash-Syu'ubiyah*), equality (*al-Musāwah*), and patriotism (*al-waṭāniyah*).

Another work about Islam and politics in Indonesia is presented by Greg Fealy¹⁵ titled *Ulama and Politics in Indonesia a History of Nahdlatul Ulama 1952-1967* which has been translated into the Indonesian language. The book describes the participation of NU in Indonesia's political sphere whereby *'ulamā* have become the architect of that organization. The author argues that NU actions in the political world have Islamic principles attached to them in which the organization has attempted to balance a deep commitment to Sunni Muslim social and political thoughts with the Indonesian national ideology *Pancasila*.

Moreover, still on the same theme, *Nahdlatul Ulama, Traditional Islam and Modernity in Indonesia* edited by Greg Fealy and Greg Barton¹⁶ underlines the roles of NU in Indonesian social and political life during the New Order period. All of the contributors make extensive use of Indonesian sources and present rich and detailed analyses of important figures and events in the history of Indonesia. Unfortunately, the book does not include a systematic discussion of the doctrinal foundation of NU. So, it is impossible to fully understand the politics of NU without paying serious attention to the religious concepts on which the organization is based.

Despite the number of existing studies, the researcher has not found any that specifically discusses the views of *kyai* on women's political participation. There is a number of studies that focus on women's political participation but very few involve the *kyai* as a major discussion. One such study is the MA thesis which was written at the University of North Sumatra, Medan. In her

¹⁵ Greg Fealy, *Ijtihad Politik Ulama: Sejarah NU 1952-1967*, (Yogyakarta: LKIS, 1998).

¹⁶ Greg Barton and Greg Fealy (eds.). *Nahdlatul Ulama, Traditional Islam and Modernity in Indonesia*, (Clayton Australia: Monash Asia Institute, 1996).

thesis entitled *Political Participation in the Regional Representatives Council (DPD) PKS (Prosperous Justice Party)*, Dina Anggita Lubis proposes¹⁷ the advancement of women's political participation due to PKS sympathizers who are not congruent with their representation in parliament. According to her, the main cause is the patriarchal social structure that sees world politics as a realm of men. But she does not conclude that patriarchal structure as the absolute religious interference or the construction of religious elite understanding who participated in preserving the culture. It is easy to understand, given that in North Sumatera, where the research was conducted, religion and religious elite do not occupy a significant position in the social and political structures as in East Java.

A similar study was conducted by M. Zainuri.¹⁸ In his thesis, *Women's Political Participation: Local Islamic Perspective in Kudus*, he puts forward his findings about the construction of patriarchal culture. The view of the Kudus people is the product of internalization of the values of orthodox Islam (*salaf*), which is not very accommodating to women. Implications of local Islamic traditions in Kudus which are loaded with nuances of patriarchy will prevent the awareness of women's political participation. The findings in this thesis are very interesting. However, *kyai* as the religious elite in charge of interpreting religious values do not have a place in the overall study.

The studies carried out by the scholars above have no indicators in their analyses that attempts to describe and understand in depth about *'ulamā fatwā* related to politics and voting behaviour. Based on that reality, this study tries to reveal the interaction between Islam and politics, in the special case of *'ulamā*

¹⁷ Dina Anggita Lubis, "Partisipasi Politik di Dewan Perwakilan Daerah (DPD) Partai Keadilan Sejahtera," (Master thesis, Universitas Sumatera Utara, 2009).

¹⁸ M. Zainuri, "Partisipasi Politik Perempuan: Perspektif Islam Lokal Kudus," (Master thesis, Universitas Diponegoro, 2007).

fatwā on women's political participation by investigating the voting behaviour among citizens in Gresik, East Java as a case study.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

To explain and answer the issues that become the focus of this study, the writer will explain a number of variables that refer to voting behaviour based on the 'ulamā *fatwā* on women's participation in Gresik East Java.

Although the history of political science has not released the Grand Theory of voting, there are three kinds of voting theories which can be grouped into three major schools. The first is the sociological model, often identified as the School of Columbia with the main reference in Applied Bureau of Social Research of Columbia University. The work begins with the publication of the book *The People's Choice* (Lazarsfeld, Berelson, & Gaudet, 1944) that focuses on the influences of social factors based on a survey of 600 prospective voters in a single community over the course of the 1940 presidential campaign in United States of America.¹⁹ Sociological approach states that personal background such as gender, social class, race, religion, ideology and region of origin is an independent variable that affects the decision of voters to vote.²⁰ According to the Columbia model, voting behaviour is determined by socio-economic status, religion and area of residence. So, if someone belongs to a particular socio-economic status, it means that he chooses a particular political party. If he has a particular religion, he would choose a particular political party. If he lives in a certain area, he then will choose a

¹⁹ P. F. Lazarsfeld, B. R. Berelson, and H. Gaudet, *The People's Choice: How the Voter Makes up His Mind in a Presidential Campaign*. (New York: Columbia University Press, 1944).

²⁰ Affan Gaffar, *Javanese Voters: A Case Study of Election under a Hegemonic Party System*, (Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada University Press, 1992). 4-9.

particular political party. This school is also known as social or structural sociological approach.

In contrast to the previous approach that puts more emphasis on sociological factors, the socio-psychological approach emphasises individuals. The psycho social model is identified as School of Michigan, which has its major reference in the work of Campbell, Converse, Miller and Stokes (1960) —*The American Voter* — and assumes that party identification is the main factor behind the behaviour of voters.²¹ According to social psychological approach, there are three factors that influence voting behaviour. The factors are party identification, issues or themes and orientations promoted by candidates. Party identification refers to not just the chosen party but also the level of identification such as between weak to strong of the individual towards the party. Then next factor concerns the orientation issues or themes raised by the parties. Meanwhile, the orientation of the candidate questions who will represent the political parties. According to this approach, three factors that are mentioned above will determine the voting behaviour.²²

In addition, there is also rational choice theory. It refers to an economic model called School of Rochester, whose landmark work is the work of Anthony Downs (1957) — *An Economic Theory of Democracy* — that emphasises variables such as rationality, choice, uncertainty and information.²³ Based on this approach, people are assumed as rational voters. Individuals anticipate any consequences that may arise from the available choices. Then, from the options, individuals will choose the option that gives the greatest benefit for themselves.

²¹ A. Campbell, P. E. Converse, W. E. Miller, D. E. Stokes, *The American Voter*. (New York: Wiley, 1960).

²² Affan Gaffar, *Javanese Voters*...4-9.

²³ Anthony Downs, *An Economic Theory of Democracy*. (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1957).

The three kinds of voting theory above is used by political scholars as a reference for understanding the behaviour of voters in countries such as America, Europe, and Asia, but these approaches can not seem to be exactly applied to understand the behaviour of voters in Indonesia. There is no Western concept that can absolutely be applied to conduct empirical studies on voting behaviour in Indonesia. It does not mean the theories are not used at all.

Sociological school is used to examine segregation in society where it is divided into two major groups: the rulers (leaders) and ruled (community members). In addition, societal groups formed by level of education, occupation, place of residence (rural or urban), can help explain voting behaviour in Indonesia. While the psychological school is expected to provide perspective of internalization and socialization of cultural values, customs and habits that shape the political culture of the community which in turn will affect voter behaviour. The merging of the two approaches is called the socio-cultural approach.

Kristiadi conducted a study of voting behaviour by using socio-cultural approach to explain the tendencies of society in determining their choices to a particular political party. This study examines the relationship between party identification of the role model with the party identification of a person. Another variable that was also examined by Kristiadi to identify societies' voter behaviour was the relation of news release in the mass media and social structure.²⁴ Kristiadi concluded that the social interaction of Indonesian society was still paternalistic, in spite of the rapid social change fairly for more than two decades, especially among members and community leaders. Community leaders, both formal and in formal are treated as role models. Among therole models, the bureaucrats are those who

²⁴ J. Kristiadi, "Pemilihan Umum dan Perilaku Pemilih di Indonesia", *Prisma*, 3, Maret 1996, 74.